



# AGENDA REPORT

**TO:** Edward D. Reiskin  
City Administrator

**FROM:** Ian Appleyard  
Human Resources  
Management Director

**SUBJECT:** SUPPLEMENTAL – Vacancy Rate  
Report

**DATE:** August 15, 2022

City Administrator Approval

Date: Aug 22, 2022

## RECOMMENDATION

Receive An Informational Report From The City Administrator Regarding (1) The Vacancy Rates Of All City Departments, (2) The Vacancy Rates Of Similar Departments Of Local Public Entities, (3) And Attrition/Separation Of Staff From All City Departments From January 1, 2018 To March 31, 2022 To Include Race, Ethnicity, Religion And Gender And Pay Scale.

## REASON FOR SUPPLEMENTAL

This supplemental report provides additional information that was requested by the Finance & Management Committee at its February 7, 2022 (**Attachment A**), April 11, 2022 (**Attachment B**), and June 13, 2022 (**Attachment C**), meetings. At the June 13, 2022, meeting the following questions were asked:

- 1. And Attrition/Separation Of Staff from All City Departments From January 1, 2018 to March 31, 2022 To Include Race, Ethnicity, Religion and Gender and Pay Scale.**

The below tables are responsive to the above information request, which includes a breakdown by Race (**Table 1**), Gender (**Table 2**), and reason for all separations (**Table 3**) from January 1, 2018 to March 31, 2022. To better understand the City of Oakland's Race and Gender demographic, census data from 2000, 2010, and 2020 (**Table 4**) are included. Additionally, the Race and Gender data of the City of Oakland's Full-Time workforce as of March 31, 2022, is included (**Table 5**).

<b>Table 1: Race</b>		
<b>Race</b>	<b>Count</b>	<b>Avg Pay</b>
American Indian or Alaska Native	6	\$50.09
Asian	221	\$49.16
Black or African American	406	\$46.78
Hispanic or Latino	266	\$47.25
Native Hawaiian/Other Pacific Islander	14	\$47.55
Two or More Races	21	\$41.86
White	427	\$56.43
NA	14	\$41.70
<b>Total</b>	<b>1375</b>	

<b>Table 2: Gender</b>		
<b>Gender</b>	<b>Count</b>	<b>Avg Pay</b>
Female	563	\$47.49
Male	812	\$51.99
Avg		\$50.14
<b>Total</b>	<b>1375</b>	

<b>Table 3: Reason for Separation</b>	
<b>Reason</b>	<b>Count</b>
Deceased	16
Discharged	133
Lack of Work/Temporary	36
Resigned	717
Retirement	473
<b>Total</b>	<b>1375</b>

Table 4: City of Oakland Census Data								
	2000			2010			2020	
American Indian and Alaska Native	2,655	0.70%		3,040	0.80%		3,834	0.91%
Asian	60,851	15.20%		65,811	16.80%		66,182	15.72%
Black or African American	142,460	35.70%		109,471	28.00%		99,416	23.61%
Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander	2,002	0.50%		2,222	0.60%		2,672	0.63%
Some other race	46,592	11.70%		53,378	13.70%		67,598	16.14%
Two or more races	19,911	5.00%		21,877	5.60%		28,812	6.84%
White	125,013	31.30%		134,925	34.50%		152,168	36.14%
Male	192,757	48.30%		189,519	48.50%		203,786	48.40%
Female	206,727	51.70%		201,205	51.50%		217,256	51.60%

Table 5: City of Oakland FT Workforce Demographics		
FT Employees on March 31, 2022	#	%
American Indian or Alaska Native	24	0.71%
Asian	604	17.86%
Black or African American	1029	30.43%
Hispanic or Latino	699	20.67%
Native Hawaiian/Other Pacific Islander	81	2.40%
Two or More Races	43	1.27%
White	884	26.15%
Not reported	17	0.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>3381</b>	<b>100.00%</b>
Female	1294	38.27%
Male	2087	61.73%
<b>Total</b>	<b>3381</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**2. What efforts are being taken by Human Resources and Workforce Development partnerships with non-profits and community organizations to recruit and retain Oakland residents for City of Oakland jobs?**

Human Resources Management (HRM) and the Economic and Workforce Development Department (EWDD) are working together to recruit and retain Oakland residents for City of Oakland jobs more effectively. The Workforce Development Division of EWDD has launched “Oakland Forward,” a year-round youth and young adult employment program to increase employment and develop public service career pathways. While the program is not solely focused on City of Oakland jobs, this new, state-funded program will focus on the areas of public safety

and climate resilience. Through the Oakland Forward program, Workforce Development staff are also working closely with the Department of Violence Prevention (DVP), Oakland Public Works (OPW), and the Oakland Police Department (OPD) to increase employment opportunities for young people ages 16-30. Funding support will go towards salary for 10 OPD cadets, a pilot training and employment program for OPW that supports new positions with their Safety and Training department, and an estimated 20 youth positions in DVP through their Career Exploration and Education programming. The success of these investments will support the expansion of these efforts to other City departments, including HRM, in the upcoming year.

In addition to the above, Oakland Public Library (OPL) applies a Race and Equity lens when recruiting and hiring Temporary Part-Time Library Aides. This classification is the entry-level position for the library system and requires a High School Degree or equivalent. Temporary Part-Time positions are not subject to the rigorous civil service hiring process, which enables greater flexibility in screening and placing applicants.

Library Aide recruitments are promoted online, at libraries in zip codes ranking high on equity indicators, and through social media networks. The screening process focuses on the following criteria:

- Cultural and Racial competency and diversity
- Bi-lingual language skills
- Recent OUSD graduates or other “youth intern” placements
- Reside in zip codes in Oakland scoring high on Equity Index
- Demonstrated community service, volunteerism, identification, or experience with disadvantaged or marginalized populations (foster youth, LGBTQ, formerly incarcerated, etc.)

These efforts create a pipeline of talent that reflect the Oakland community and the patrons served by the Library. Once hired into the Temporary Part-Time classification, these employees are eligible to apply for permanent city positions through “restricted” recruitments, which prioritizes current City employees. Over time, permanent positions are filled with individuals who have deep community ties, who racially and culturally reflect Oakland’s diverse population, and who serve library patrons with a passion born from their knowledge and experience.

### **3. Status update on how off-site cannabis use relates to Hiring.**

The Federal Motor Carrier Safety Administration (FMCSA), along with the Department of Transportation (DOT), requires that persons subject to the commercial driver’s license (CDL) requirements and their employers follow alcohol and drug testing rules. These rules include procedures for testing, frequency of tests, and substances tested for. Full requirements and detailed information on the subject are available here: <https://www.fmcsa.dot.gov/regulations/drug-alcohol-testing/employers-resources-and-downloads>

For classifications requiring a CDL, generally, the types of testing are as follows:

- Pre-employment – An employer must receive a negative drug test result before permitting a CDL driver to operate a commercial motor vehicle (CMV) (§382.301)
- Post-accident – Drug and alcohol tests may be required after crashes (§382.303)
- Random – CDL drivers must be randomly tested throughout the year (§382.305)

- Reasonable suspicion – Drivers who appear to be under the influence of drugs or alcohol can be immediately tested (§382.307)
- Return-to-duty – Required for drivers who tested positive, refused, or otherwise violated the prohibitions of 49 CFR Part 382 Subpart B; and who have completed the return-to-duty process with a DOT-qualified substance abuse professional
- Follow-up – Required for drivers who tested positive, refused, or otherwise violated the prohibitions of 49 CFR Part 382 Subpart B; and who have completed the return-to-duty process with a DOT-qualified substance abuse professional, and have tested negative for a return-to-duty test

Outside of the test required by Federal law, the City also performs the following types of tests for employees without CDL:

- Pre-Employment Drug Testing –Police Trainees are subject to pre-employment testing under California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training (POST). Firefighter Trainees are not subject to pre-employment testing. There are other “safety-sensitive” positions that may be subject to such testing and the City is currently evaluating that process and list of classifications.
- Reasonable Suspicion Testing – Conducted when the city has reasonable suspicion tests based on articulable factual reason to believe that an employee was impaired at work.
- Post-accident – Conducted on all employees following an accident that resulted in substantial loss of life or property.
- Annual Physical – City of Oakland Firefighters are given a drug test during their annual physicals. This process is managed by Oakland Fire Department.

For all the drug tests (both DOT and other), laboratory testing is for the following five classes of drugs: Marijuana, Cocaine, Opiates (opium and codeine derivatives), Amphetamines and Methamphetamines, and Phencyclidine (PCP). For reasonable suspicion and post-accident tests, alcohol is also tested. Drug tests are conducted via urinalysis and alcohol is tested by a breathalyzer.

#### 4. What are the departmental priority lists for hiring?

A list of the following departments, their hiring priorities, and if the recruitment is being conducted in-house (HR) or with an outside consultant, the Cooperative Personnel Services (CPS) is in **Attachment D**: Transportation, Public Works, Planning and Building, Police, Fire, Economic and Workforce Development, Housing and Community Development, and Finance.

As of the writing of this report, the CPS contract amount is \$2M, and in place until 8/31/23. To date, \$549,693.13 has been spent.

Below is an update on Police Dispatch staffing:

- Number of budgeted positions: **76**
- Number filled (of those, number in training): **63 (18 in training)**
- Number of applicants in the background process: **33**

## **5. What is the Budgeted Vacancy Rate and what is the rate for the Fiscal Year 2022/23?**

The “budgetary vacancy factor,” is distinct from the “vacancy rate.” The “budgetary vacancy factor” is a negative percentage applied to all positions, which reduces the cost of each, to account for cost savings that are anticipated from vacant positions through the fiscal year. The “budgetary vacancy factor” is fixed in the Adopted Budget and applied to the various Departments. Historically, the budgeted vacancy factor has been 4.0% for most Departments. In the 2022-23 Adopted Budget, however, the Citywide vacancy factor was set at 10.25% for most City Departments to account for the anticipated vacancies over the Fiscal Year.

## **6. What is an encumbered vacancy as opposed to a non-encumbered vacancy?**

Vacancies are described as **non-encumbered** and **encumbered** in the semi-annual Staffing Report. The former is available to be filled and not linked for any other purpose, such as overtime, temporary staffing, or acting assignments. The latter is tied to one of the aforementioned purposes.

As of May 2, 2022, there were 772.14 Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) positions vacant citywide with 36.0 FTE encumbered as described above. Removing the encumbered positions reduces the vacancies to 736.14 FTE and a vacancy rate of 16.33 percent.

## **7. Additional information**

Included in this report is an article, “*Where Have All The Workers Gone?*” (**Attachment E**). In this article, Howard Risher describes the staffing shortages that are affecting the public sector nationwide. The author presents the impact of vacancies, shifts in workforce demographics, and the need to change the work environment to be more adaptable and flexible. HRM’s work on a Racial Equity Action plan for 2023 will be an important element in implementing needed change.

## **COORDINATION**

HRM coordinated the Finance, Economic Workforce Development and other City Departments to gather data and information for this report.

## **PUBLIC OUTREACH / INTEREST**

No outreach was necessary for this report beyond the standard City Council agenda noticing procedures.

## **SUSTAINABLE OPPORTUNITIES**

**Economic:** There are no economic impacts associated with this informational report.

**Environmental:** There are no environmental impacts associated with this informational report.

**Race & Equity:**

As described in early reports, the public sector is struggling to fill positions at the national, state, and local levels. The City of Oakland faces similar struggles coupled with a time-intensive merit-based process. In some areas of Oakland, the unemployment rate is triple that of the regional rate. HRM understands the need to fill positions with highly qualified candidates but also carefully analyzes who is filling those positions.

The HRM Equity Change Team, in collaboration with the recruitment division, has developed Equity Goals to achieve more equitable outcomes for employees and make the City of Oakland an Employer of Choice. To date, the HRM Team has incorporated the Racial Equity in Recruitment and Selection Toolkit into recruitment efforts; race and equity performance standards into the Performance Management system; race and equity programs into the New Employee Orientation and Supervisory Academy; and mandatory participation in the Race and Equity Academy for all HRM staff.

Those goals and desired outcomes of the HRM Equity Team include:

- Reducing and removing barriers to achieve more equitable results in the entire recruitment process, including updating job qualifications that are not necessary for a person to do the job on day one.
- Partnering with departments to prioritize recruitments for positions that provide critical services BIPOC Oakland communities.
- Eliminating disparities related to racial/ethnic identity, gender identity and expression, disabilities, and additional intersecting communities in hiring, promotion, retention, and development through the use of the Racial Equity in Recruitment and Selection Toolkit.
- Engaging in purposeful community outreach by partnering with City departments and community organizations to expand awareness of the City of Oakland job opportunities.

The work plan for the HRM Equity Team for 2023 includes:

- Developing a **Racial Equity Action Plan** to assess, update and implement policies and systems through a racial equity lens to adjust to the evolving and changing workplace.
- Creating a Digital Engagement Plan to increase exposure and interest in City of Oakland jobs throughout the Oakland community.
- Updating the Performance Appraisal process to include standards for racial equity competency at the staff and management level.
- **Developing an Inclusive Engagement in Recruitment Guide** for departments to use as a tool during recruitments.
- **Identifying racial disparities in employee outcomes** impacted by HR processes to better understand how to remove barriers and establish successful career pathways for all employees throughout their employee life cycle with the City of Oakland.
- Requiring **Hiring Bias Reduction training** for all staff involved in the recruitment and selection of city employees.
- Creating a **career development series** of trainings to better attract and retain talent, which will include training on the City of Oakland job application process.
- Building a network of community, workforce development, and human resources partners to increase access and visibility to City of Oakland jobs. Outcomes will be measured by

examining the application, candidate, and interview pools to determine impacts on people of color.

**ACTION REQUESTED OF THE CITY COUNCIL**

Staff Recommends That The City Council Receive This Informational Report From The City Administrator Regarding (1) The Vacancy Rates Of All City Departments, (2) The Vacancy Rates Of Similar Departments Of Local Public Entities, (3) And Attrition/Separation Of Staff from All City Departments From January 1, 2018 To March 31, 2022 To Include Race, Ethnicity, Religion And Gender And Pay Scale.

For questions regarding this report, please contact Ian Appleyard, Human Resources Director, at (510) 238-6450.

Respectfully submitted,



---

IAN APPLEYARD  
Human Resources Director

Attachments (5):

- A. Information Report Regarding Vacancies dated February 7, 2022
- B. Supplemental Report Regarding Vacancies dated April 11, 2022
- C. Supplemental Report Regarding Vacancies dated June 13, 2022
- D. List of City of Oakland Department Priorities
- E. Article "*Where Have All The Workers Gone?*" dated August 9, 2022