



AGENDA REPORT

TO: Edward D. Reiskin
City Administrator

FROM: Ian Appleyard
HRM Director

SUBJECT: SUPPLEMENTAL – Vacancy Rate
Report

DATE: March 14, 2022

City Administrator Approval

Date: Mar 28, 2022

RECOMMENDATION

Staff Recommends That The City Council Receive An Informational Report From The City Administrator Regarding:

- 1) The Vacancy Rate, Salary Schedule, And Total Number Of Budgeted And Vacant Positions For Each Classification In The Departments Of Transportation, Planning And Building, And Public Works By Department; And**
- 2) The Classification Level Vacancy Rates Of Similar Departments Of Local Public Entities And Special Districts; And**
- 3) For Classifications In Oakland With A Vacancy Rate Of More Than 20%, Salary Schedules For Similar Classifications Of Local Public Entities And Special Districts; And**
- 4) Which Vacancies Have The Greatest Impact On Each Department.**

REASON FOR SUPPLEMENTAL

This supplemental report provides additional information that was requested by the Finance & Management Committee at its February 7, 2022, meeting.

1. What efforts are being taken to increase community outreach in highly underemployed areas?

Human Resources Management (HRM) performs outreach by attending job fairs, community events, program workshops and social media and email campaigns. Examples of some of the events HRM has attended include the East Oakland Job Fair, Laney and Merritt College Career Days, Job Corps Job Fair, Chinatown Street Festival, Akoma Market (QR Code in jobs booth), Fruitvale Dia de los Muertos, and the Rubicon Programs Job Club.

The City regularly posts jobs on its social media platforms, including LinkedIn, Facebook, Twitter and Nextdoor. In addition, a weekly email with job opportunities is sent to a distribution list of community-based, governmental and non-profit agencies including Family Bridges, Volunteers of America, East Bay Asian Youth Center, Civicorps, California EDD and Rubicon Programs.

While physical attendance at job fairs and community events has decreased during the pandemic, HRM anticipates additional in-person events will occur during this calendar year. In addition, members of the HRM recruitment team formed an outreach group that was previously approved but delayed due to the pandemic.

Additionally, the City employs many Temporary Part-Time employees who are majority Oakland residents. These entry-level positions are not covered by Civil Service and can be hired more quickly. Often, these hires at Oakland Parks and Recreation Youth Development (OPRYD), Oakland Public Works and Oakland Public Library (OPL) can be a stepping stone to full-time employment with the City.

What is not listed above are the Economic and Workforce Development Department's efforts to promote youth employment and their partnerships with of community groups, including Civicorps, Lao Family Community Development, The Unity Council, and Youth Employment Partnership.

2. Status update on how off-site cannabis use relates to Hiring

The City administers drug testing in conformance with applicable City ordinances and within state and federal regulations. The applicable administrative instruction is being updated to incorporate the City's new ordinance. There are no impacts or impediments to hiring or filling positions due to off-site cannabis use.

3. Break down of exit strategy to help improve retention

Human Resources Management, in conjunction with other City departments, has developed an off-boarding guide that has been widely distributed. This guide provides a conversation guide, exit interview, and checklist to collect valuable feedback and assist with the transfer of knowledge. A copy of the guide is provided in **Attachment I**.

In addition to improving organizational effectiveness by gathering off-boarding data, the City provides generous benefits and growth opportunities:

- Alternate Work Schedules and Telecommute Options
- Robust Health Benefits
- Oakland ROCKS, an employee-driven team focused on employee appreciation, recognition, and staff pride
- Opportunities for Advancement (In FY 20-21 58% of FT/PPT positions were filled from within)
- An Expanding and Growing Citywide Training Program

4. Request to separate the Attachments in the report and include in the vacancy reports going forward Attachment D - Classifications with 5 or more positions and over 20%

These attachments have been separated.

5. Analysis on Cash hiring incentives compared to surrounding cities.

Table 1 shows the results of hiring incentives provided by Oakland’s comparator agencies. Most jurisdictions do not provide incentives.

Table 1: Regional Hiring Incentive Survey	
Agency	Incentive Description
Alameda County	Various health care positions in the Jail Deputy Sheriff Recruit \$10k over four years Deputy Sheriff I \$12k over four years Deputy Sheriff II \$14k over four years
Berkeley	No incentive
Concord	Police Lateral: Signing Bonus of \$10,000 , paid out as follows: 50% (\$5,000) payable upon satisfactory completion of the required probationary period, and 50% (\$5,000) payable upon three (3) years of continuous service.
Fremont	Police Officer: Current employees are eligible to receive \$350 for referring a candidate that attends the academy and another \$350 if they complete probation.
Hayward	No incentive
Richmond	No incentive
San Francisco	No incentive
San Jose	No response
Vallejo	No response

6. What is the goal, break down and timeline to fill vacancies

Since the number of vacancies exceeds the City’s recruitment capacity, HRM works closely with departments and the City Administrator’s Office to establish recruitment priorities. Once a recruitment is assigned to staff, the goal is to generate an eligible list within 120-days. Many factors go into this timeline including posting the job announcement, receiving and screening applicants, conducting and scoring the competitive examinations, and finalizing the eligible lists.

Currently, the City has 41 classifications open for recruitment, some with closing dates and others open on a continuous basis. There can be many positions tied to one classification and it is estimated the City is currently recruiting for approximately 150 positions.

While the goal is to generate an eligible list within 120 days, several factors can negatively impact that goal, including:

- HRM Staffing: Until recently, HRM had five vacant recruitment Analyst positions, two of which were frozen. Three of the five have recently been filled and two additional positions will be filled in April. The new Analysts will not have an impact in the short term due to training but will ultimately increase HRM’s recruitment capacity.
- Securing Assessors for Scoring Examinations: Scoring Civil Service examinations relies heavily on the use of internal and external Subject Matter Experts. External experts are particularly desirable since they bring increased objectivity to the testing process. Yet,

these experts are in high demand and can also negatively impact the timeline for recruitments.

- **Reduced Number of Applicants:** As reported in previous Staffing Reports, there has been a trend of decreased applicants for public-sector positions both regionally and nationally. In Oakland, HRM received 43% fewer applications in FY 20-21 than in FY 19-20. Projections for FY 21-22 are somewhat better; however, still 20% below FY 19-20. The impacts of fewer applicants include extended job announcement periods, delayed testing and eligible lists with fewer candidates than the number of vacancies. Overall, this requires recruitments for certain classifications to occur more frequently. **Table 2** shows the number of applicants received by regional county governments. The clear trend is there are less applicants for public sector positions.

	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021
<i>County of Alameda</i>	21,709	25,579	22,502	15,132	10,800
<i>County of Contra Costa</i>			33,048	32,769	33,260
<i>County of Santa Clara</i>		112,923	101,232	97,000	86,164
<i>County of San Mateo</i>	17,025	19,538	18,117	13,510	13,198
<i>City of Oakland</i>			14,161	14,103	8,032
<i>County of Napa</i>	7,911	6,396	6,493	4,382	5,488

- **Non-responsive candidates:** In addition to an overall reduced number of applicants, those that do apply are not responding to additional steps of the hiring process. There has been a notable increase in candidates not responding to examination invitations, not attending scheduled examinations, not responding to requests for hiring interviews or not attending interviews after confirming availability. This factor exacerbates the ability to produce robust eligible lists and fill vacancies.
- **Labor Agreement Obligations:** While there is discretion in establishing non-public safety examination priorities, there is less flexibility about public safety recruitments due to strict timeline requirements. The Police and Fire labor contracts require a tremendous amount of coordination between the departments, HRM staff and outside test vendors. Many of the examinations require at least two Analysts, which reduces availability to conduct other examinations. The addition of new HR Analysts will provide much-needed relief; however, the promotional examinations are still very demanding and divert HRM staff resources away from recruitment and classification activities for other departments.

7. What are the Attrition Rates for departments

Table 3 provides attrition rates for the current Fiscal Year as of March 11, 2022.

Table 3 - Attrition Rates by Department					
Department	Total Department FT & PPT FTE Filled	July 1, 2021 - March 1, 2022 FT & PPT Separations			FY 20-21 Attrition Rate (all separations)
		Total Separations	Retirements	Resignations	
Police	1,038.00	108	37	71	10.1%
Public Works	506.11	37	21	16	6.2%
Fire	549	31	20	11	6.3%
Transportation	250.65	20	10	10	10.1%
Human Services	149.76	20	7	13	8.3%
Library	176.4	19	7	12	6.5%
Planning & Building	154	9	3	6	10.6%

8. Data analysis of the Oakland Coliseum Job Fair

Two members of HRM attended the East Bay Job Fair & Expo held on December 2, 2021 at RingCentral Coliseum. Staff reported they had approximately 100 visitors to the Oakland Human Resources table. There is no available analysis as to how many of those that visited the table applied for jobs or attained employment as that specific data is not collected within the Applicant Tracking System used by HRM.

9. Analysis of strategic recruiting efforts and partnering on specific job training programs; and

In addition to the response in Item #1, HRM has met with staff from the Economic and Workforce Development Department to discuss filling positions through the Summer Youth Jobs Program and to expand opportunities for HRM to work with the Workforce Development Board to present available jobs and workshops to enhance skills of potential applicants throughout the community.

10. Any additional information not previously included

Table 4 shows the complete survey data from requested regional agencies. The source of the Oakland data is the November 2021 Semi-Annual Staffing report. In comparing Oakland’s rates to other jurisdictions, it appears Oakland’s rate is high for Planning and Building departments and comparable for both Transportation and Public Works departments. For the overall vacancy rate, Oakland is also comparable to the agencies that responded (Hayward, East Bay Municipal Utility District, East Bay Regional Parks and Vallejo). If a cell has “NA,” that means the information was not available.

Table 4: Regional Departmental & Overall Vacancy Rates											
	San Jose	San Fran	Berk	Concord	Hayward	EBMUD	Fremont	Richmond	EBParks	Vallejo	Oakland
Planning and Building	15.48%	13.91%	24.56%	8.60%	NA	NA	15.90%	8.33%	NA	12.50%	21.34%
Transportation	17.47%	11.90%	33.30%	16.66%	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	17.68%
Public Works	25.40%	26.32%	14.67%	19.73%	NA	NA	10.23%	17.26%	NA	20.00%	17.82%
Overall Vacancy Rate	NA	NA	NA	NA	14.80%	12.00%	NA	16.15%	11.03%	28.48%	12.03%

ACTION REQUESTED OF THE CITY COUNCIL

Staff Recommends That The City Council Receive An Informational Report From The City Administrator Regarding:

- 1) The Vacancy Rate, Salary Schedule, And Total Number Of Budgeted And Vacant Positions For Each Classification In The Departments Of Transportation, Planning And Building, And Public Works By Department; And
- 2) The Classification Level Vacancy Rates Of Similar Departments Of Local Public Entities And Special Districts; And
- 3) For Classifications In Oakland With A Vacancy Rate Of More Than 20%, Salary Schedules For Similar Classifications Of Local Public Entities And Special Districts; And
- 4) Which Vacancies Have The Greatest Impact On Each Department.

For questions regarding this report, please contact Ian Appleyard, Human Resources Director,
at (510) 238-6450

Respectfully submitted,



IAN APPLEYARD
Human Resources Director

Attachments (9):

- A. City of Oakland Salary Ordinance
- B. Links to Salary Schedules for Local Public Entities and Special Districts
- C. January 2022 Position Control Report all Departments
- D. List of Classifications with over 20% Vacancies for all Departments
- E. Total Number of Budgeted and Vacant Positions for each Classification in the Department of Transportation
- F. Total Number of Budgeted and Vacant Positions for each Classification in the Public Works Department
- G. Total number of Budgeted and Vacant Positions for each Classification in the Planning and Building Department
- H. City-wide Frozen Positions by Department and Position
- I. Offboarding Guide

