

TO:	Edward D. Reiskin City Administrator	FRO		LeRonne L. Armstrong Chief of Police
SUBJECT:	Action Plan Regarding Recruitment, Hiring And Retention Plans	DATI	E:	February 17, 2022
City Administra Approval	tor _{Clizabeth Lake}	Date	Feb 24	4, 2022

RECOMMENDATION

Staff Recommends That City Council Receive An Informational Report With Detailed Recommendations For An Action Plan From The City Administrator And The Oakland Police Chief Regarding Recruitment, Hiring And Retention Plans And Strategies To Recruit Police Officers, As Well As Data On Attrition For The Past Ten Years Including Demographics, Tenure And Specific Reasons For Leaving; Costs Of Academies; And Costs Of Pre-Academies. For Officers Who Cite "Lack Of Confidence In OPD Leadership" Provide Specific Reason For Leaving, Including Discipline By OPD/Chief Or Community Police Review Agency All To Protect The Citizens Of Oakland Prior To Engaging Additional Consultants And Making Financial Commitments.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report provides information about Oakland Police Department (OPD) sworn and professional staffing beyond what is included in the Quarterly Police Staffing Report (4th Quarter) dated January 14, 2022 (*Attachment A*). The report details strategies for funding and implementing police academies, which are required to prepare trainees to become fully operational police officers. The report also details the following related topics:

- Measures to increase police academy matriculation for greater efficiency and higher graduation rates;
- OPDs Recruitment plan as well as efforts to recruit for race and gender diversity;
- OPDs Pre-Academy Program to better prepare police officer trainees for academy success;
- Enhanced support for trainees in academies and field training to improve graduation rates and needed support for long term career success;
- Attrition and retention analysis why are officers leaving OPD and measures taken to mitigate these losses; and
- Police academy fiscal information.

BACKGROUND AND LEGISLATIVE HISTORY

City Council President Nikki Fortunato Bas, Councilmember Noel Gallo, and President Pro Tempore Sheng Thao scheduled an informational report at the December 16, 2021, Rules and Legislation Committee; Councilmember Noel Gallo requested the current revised title at the January 13, 2022 Rules Committee.

The Quarterly Police Staffing Report (*Attachment A*) is the latest iteration of this report provided to the Public Safety Committee and/or released to the City Council, Office of the Mayor, and the public via the City's website four times each year. This report covers the following topics:

- Sworn and professional OPD staffing levels (by position and rank), historic sworn staffing levels, and position vacancies;
- Average OPD Communications (911) dispatch response time to calls for service.
- Part 1 Crimes in Oakland for the equivalent reporting period;
- Demographic (race, gender, and residency) information for sworn personnel;
- Sworn personnel attrition data and top reasons for separation according to confidential exit interviews; and
- Recruitment information.

Additionally, an Oral Report titled "Receive An Oral Report Including The Following; (1) An Update On Current And Projected Police Department Sworn-Staffing Levels; (2) Proposed Modifications To Police Department's Hiring Plan To Restore Sworn Staffing To Levels At Or Above Measure Z Staffing Requirement" was presented to the November 9, 2021 Special Public Safety Committee. This report covered the following topic areas:

- Efforts to maintain OPD sworn staffing levels above 678 officers to stay in compliance with Measure Z staffing requirements. This presentation discussed the sworn officer hiring process:
 - Six months of training and approximately 16 weeks of field training, close to an entire year to become a fully sworn officer.
 - OPDs new "pre-academy" program to give potential recruits more preparation to succeed in OPD Police Officer Trainee (POT) academies.
 - The Merritt College Law Enforcement Education Program which helps recruit potential POTs and supports their success in the OPD POT academies.
 - Need to reduce attrition. In 2021 attrition went from 5.5 per month to approximately 8 officers per month.
- A cadre of 39 POTs began the 187th Academy in December 2021(there were 34 POTs in the program at the time of the production of this report).
- Staffing (as of Nov 2021) 676; staffing was closer to 730 at the same time in 2020.
- Possibility of a supplemental academy in March 2022.

ANALYSIS AND POLICY ALTERNATIVES

OPD Hiring and Recruitment Efforts

Pages 14-15 of the Quarterly Staffing Report (*Attachment A*) provides detailed information about OPDs current recruitment and hiring efforts. The report explains in part that, "During the October – December 2021 quarter, OPD hosted and/or attended 18 recruitment events. Six events were online, 12 events were in person, and 8 events were in Oakland. During these events, OPD interacted with applicants interested in POT and other positions and provided information about the jobs."

OPD received approval for four academies as part of the Fiscal Year (FY) 2021-22 budget and funding for an additional Police Academy by the City Council on September 21, 2021, Resolution No. 88822 C.M.S. The 187th Police Academy has begun, and recruitment is currently underway for the 188th Academy (second and third budgeted for this fiscal year). The 187th Academy will end in April 2022, with the graduates completing Field Training in August 2022, there are currently 34 POTs enrolled. The 188th Academy is scheduled for March 2022 and Field Training will be complete in December 2022.

In order to increase the number of POTs in each academy, OPD resumed in person outreach during the July – September 2021 quarter and hosted and/or attended 34 recruitment events. Ten events were online, 24 events were in person, and 14 events were in Oakland [the Quarterly Staffing Report (*Attachment A*) provides location information, which includes local events such as career fairs, Oakland First Fridays and presentations at Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCU). On 12 occasions, OPD staff visited various locations and distributed recruitment flyers. During these events, OPD interacted with applicants interested in POT and other positions and provided information about jobs.

OPD completed its 2022-2023 Recruiting, Training and Retention Strategic Plan (*Attachment* **B**). This multi-pronged plan includes strategies OPD will use to attract the right candidates, provide them support before they start the Academy, and provide them continued training even after graduation. Strategies include targeted local and national recruiting events, increased support for potential POTs and expansion of OPD presence on social media. OPD also created a pre-academy program to support POTs so they are ready emotionally, mentally, and physically to join the Academy. Additionally, there is post-Academy support available after graduation including mentoring and remedial instruction for those who need it. To round out the plan, OPD outlines retention strategies which foster greater engagement and communication with recruits. The goal of these retention strategies is to ensure recruits know they are valued and valuable employees and remain committed members of the OPD team.

OPD is working with CPS Consulting an external Human Resource (HR) consulting firm who has created a marketing plan, targeted to eventually fill open positions. Their marketing plan includes a targeted plan to increase applicants for posting on Facebook and Instagram. The firm will provide ad sources for national police associations whose membership includes women and people of color. Finally, the firm plans to increase contact with local community and religious leaders who can encourage their membership to apply.

Recruiting for Diversity

One of the most effective ways to attract a larger and diverse candidate pool is by using video and social media marketing. The Recruiting and Background Unit (RBU) utilizes the following platforms for recruiting and outreach:

- OPD Jobs Website <u>www.opdjobs.com</u>
- Facebook https://m.facebook.com/opdjobs/
- Twitter https://twitter.com/opdjobs
- Instagram <u>www.instagram.com/opd_jobs</u>

The Department has also entered into a marketing campaign with 24-Hour Fitness to showcase a diverse group of OPD employees to attract a broad spectrum of local candidates from various cultural backgrounds. OPD recognizes that representation is important and illustrating OPDs diversity will remain a focus of this marketing campaign.

The Department continues to recruit with an emphasis on women in law enforcement. OPD has held several targeted virtual online seminars on the topic of "women in law enforcement" to address specific concerns of women considering a career in law enforcement.

The RBU has undertaken numerous procedures to support potential POTs, including:

- Increasing the number of practice physical ability test (PAT) workshops for applicants who are experiencing difficulty in the area of physical fitness.
- Ongoing collaboration with Merritt College to advertise POT and Police Communications Dispatcher (PCD) positions, including having professors share information in class and provide a link to the OPD website with hiring information.
- Expanding options for POT testing to include South Bay Regional Testing Center
 - Increased frequency of testing
 - Variety of days and times for testing

Further, POTs who leave the academy will have an independent exit interview with individuals outside of the Training Division. OPD hopes to use this information to calibrate recruitment and academy training to best meet the needs of POTs while adhering to all best practices and California Police Officer Standards and Training (POST) requirements.

Pre-Academy Program

Chief Armstrong initiated a Pre-Academy Program to provide additional support to POTs before officially entering the academy – the first one was hosted for the 187th Academy Class. The Pre-Academy is held in house by OPD Training staff during the four weeks just prior to the academy start date. Participation is recommended but not required. The program provides POTs with insight into what is expected of them. They are provided with the academy curriculum and expectations, which provides them a head start with academics and physical training.

The pre-academy provides POTs with information to reinforce a career in law enforcement is truly the path they want to pursue and that the City of Oakland is where they want to pursue it. OPD is hopeful that the pre-academy will greatly reduce the number of people who quit during the program.

OPD now provides applicants with additional help with the POT hiring process. The RBU staff holds practice PAT events to allow applicants to see the exact course they are required to complete before they take the official PAT exam. RBU staff also helps applicants understand the exact nature of what to expect in terms of physical demands from the academy. Applicants who take advantage of this resource show up on test day knowing exactly what is expected of them. Staff also plans to hosts oral board workshops, which mimic actual oral board exams – featuring an officer, City of Oakland employee, and City of Oakland resident. This work is done with assistance from the City's Human Resources Department. The oral board workshop provides applicants with information on what to expect during the oral board exam and instructions on how to do well in the exam.

POT Academy Support

OPDs Training Division has taken steps to increase the success rate of POTs in the Academy:

- Only the POST objectives are evaluated which inherently leads to a higher success rate.
- Accept all POST minimum scores no longer adhering to a universal 85 percent minimum pass score. Instead, 70% is the minimum passing score except for some POST exams, where the minimum passing scores are pre-determined by POST (RBC modular exams, LD 34, and the WSTB)¹.
- New mentorship program for all POTs where they are paired with more experienced officers.
- Look for best times to test POTs; no testing when POTs are experiencing fatigue from academy work.
- The Chief of Police reviews all removals from the Academy program to ensure that the Training Staff adheres to POST standards.

New Officer Field Training Support

OPDs Training Division has taken steps to increase the success rate of new field training officers (FTO) in the Field Training Program, including:

- Instituting a mentorship program.
- Intervening and providing additional assistance when a new police officer is struggling with the position demands,
- Removing an officer from the street for 1-2 weeks to provide classroom and other remedial instruction to improve performance.
- Pairing FTOs and officers based on learning needs.

Attrition and Retention

Page 6 of the of the Quarterly Staffing Report (*Attachment A*) provides detailed information on attrition. The data shows an average attrition rate of eight officers per month over the past 12 months. **Table 1** and **Table 2** below indicate the reasons for separation for sworn personnel and professional staff, respectively.

¹ RBC – Regular Basic Course Modular Exam

LD – Learning Domain 34 – First Aid/CPR

WSTB – Work Sample Test Battery

Reasons for Separation	2021	2022
Better Job	1	
Family	2	
Relocating		1
Pursuing Further Education		
Health Reasons		
Dissatisfaction with OPD Leadership	9	
Dissatisfaction with City Leadership	7	
NSA Oversight	1	
Dissatisfaction with Coworkers		
Heavy Discipline	7	
Work Exhaustion		
Work/Life Balance		
Working Conditions		
Poor Training/Development	1	
Poor Equipment		
Physical Requirements of Job		
Low Morale	1	
Leaving Law Enforcement		
Vaccination Mandate		
Declined to Provide		
Total	29	1

Table 1: Reasons for Sworn OPD Personnel Separations

Table 2: Reasons for Professional OPD Personnel Separations

Reasons for Separation	2021	2022
Better Job		
Family	1	
Relocating		
Pursing Further Education		
Health Reasons		
Dissatisfaction with OPD Leadership	2	1
Dissatisfaction with City Leadership	1	
NSA Oversight		
Dissatisfaction with Coworkers		

Page 6

Reasons for Separation	2021	2022
Heavy Discipline		
Work Exhaustion		
Work/Life Balance		
Working Conditions		
Mandatory Overtime	3	
Poor Training/Development	3	
Poor Equipment	1	
Physical Requirements of Job		
Low Morale	1	
Leaving Law Enforcement		
Vaccination Mandate		
Declined to Provide		
Total	12	1

The report also explains that in September 2021, Chief Armstrong mandated all personnel who voluntarily separate from OPD (excluding service retirements) to participate in an exit interview with the Human Resources Manager or a member of the OPD Executive Team. The top four reasons for separation are:

- 1. Dissatisfaction with OPD leadership
- 2. Dissatisfaction with City leadership
- 3. Heavy discipline
- 4. Family

Table 3 below indicates 10 years of attrition data for sworn personnel including demographics, reasons for leaving, and the tenure in years upon the date of separation.

 Table 3: 2012-2022 Attrition Data for Sworn Personnel

	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022
Demographics											
Male	45	61	63	56	73	43	44	59	49	75	11
Female	7	8	5	4	6	7	5	5	9	9	1
White	22	31	25	24	28	18	23	22	29	33	4
Black	10	14	13	11	17	12	11	12	9	8	3
Hispanic	12	14	11	11	16	11	6	19	13	29	4
Asian	8	7	14	7	12	8	6	8	5	11	0
Filipino	0	0	3	4	4	0	2	2	1	1	0
Native American	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	1	0

Edward D. Reiskin, City Administrator Subject: Action Plan Regarding Recruitment, Hiring And Retention Plans Date: February 17, 2022

Page 8

	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022
Unknown	0	2	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
Undeclared- Other	0	1	1	2	2	1	0	1	1	1	0
Reasons for leaving											
Disability Retired off duty	0	0	0	3	1	0	1	0	0	2	0
Disability Retired on duty	22	34	17	14	18	16	9	12	5	5	2
Discharged	0	1	2	1	1	1	2	2	8	4	0
Discharged on Probation	1	1	6	3	4	3	3	5	2	3	0
Deceased	0	3	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0
Resignation Service Retirement	15 14	19 11	27 16	23 15	38 17	15 15	20 14	27 18	25 18	51 18	8
Tenure (in years)											
>1	4	4	16	19	22	7	9	20	7	3	1
1-10	19	18	16	12	20	14	14	13	26	50	8
10-20	12	19	17	12	17	10	7	9	9	10	0
20-30	11	27	18	17	19	19	15	19	14	20	3
30+	6	1	1	0	1	0	4	3	2	1	0
Total	52	69	68	60	79	50	49	64	58	84	12

Costs of Academies and Pre-Academies

The current comprehensive cost of an OPD POT Training Academy for the Fiscal Year (FY) 2021-22 is approximately \$3.95 million dollars. This cost includes the per-POT compensation of \$48,537 (FY 2021-22) for the six-month academy program. The majority of the \$3.95 million dollar cost consists of salary and benefit costs of the many staff in OPD and its Training Division over the half year of each academy. For FY 2022-23, costs for POTs will increase to \$50,968 each. However, based on Resolution No. 88942 C.M.S. passed by the City Council on February 7, 2021 to fund a third (187th) academy in 2021, the expected per-academy cost will be closer to \$3.57 million dollars. This lower cost is based on the stipulations in Resolution No. 88942

C.M.S., to budget for 33 POTs per academy as opposed to the higher number of 41 POTs. The lower cost reflects a smaller number of POTs and associated lower numbers of OPD staff support.

PUBLIC OUTREACH / INTEREST

No outreach was deemed necessary for this report beyond the standard City Council agenda noticing procedures.

COORDINATION

No interagency coordination was required for the production of this report.

FISCAL IMPACT

There is no fiscal impact associated with informational report.

SUSTAINABLE OPPORTUNITIES

Economic: There are no economic opportunities associated with this report.

Environmental: There are no environmental opportunities associated with this report.

Race and Social Equity: OPD staffing directly impacts the ability to support public safety and the quality of life of all Oakland residents and visitors.

Page 10

ACTION REQUESTED OF THE PUBLIC SAFETY COMMITTEE

Receive An Informational Report With Detailed Recommendations For An Action Plan From The City Administrator And The Oakland Police Chief Regarding Recruitment, Hiring And Retention Plans And Strategies To Recruit Police Officers, As Well As Data On Attrition For The Past Ten Years Including Demographics, Tenure And Specific Reasons For Leaving; Costs Of Academies; And Costs Of Pre-Academies. For Officers Who Cite "Lack Of Confidence In OPD Leadership" Provide Specific Reason For Leaving, Including Discipline By OPD/Chief Or Community Police Review Agency All To Protect The Citizens Of Oakland Prior To Engaging Additional Consultants And Making Financial Commitments.

Respectfully-submitted,

LeRonne L. Armstrong

Chief of Police Oakland Police Department

Reviewed by: Christopher Bolton, Deputy Chief of Police OPD, Bureau of Field Operations I

Kiona Suttle Deputy Director Bureau of Services

Written by: Tracey Jones, Police Services Manager OPD, Research and Planning Section

Bruce Stoffmacher, Legislation + Privacy Manager OPD, Research and Planning Section

Attachments: **2 A**: OPD 2021 Quarter Four Staffing Report **B**: 2022-2023 Recruiting, Training and Retention Strategic Plan