



TO:	Edward D. Reiskin City Administrator	FROM:	G. Harold Duffey Director, Oakland Public Works Department
SUBJECT:	Illegal Dumping Surveillance Camera Program	DATE:	December 7, 2021
City Administrator Approval		Date:	Dec 8, 2021

RECOMMENDATION

Staff Recommends That The Public Works Committee Receive An Informational Report On The Use Of Cameras To Monitor Illegal Dumping Hot Spots Throughout The City Of Oakland.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The City of Oakland (City) allocates millions of dollars annually for the removal of illegal dumping throughout the City. Resources include seventy-one (71) men and women of Oakland Public Works (OPW) that collect illegal dumping, usually within three days of it being reported to Oak311. That said, the City's approach to illegal dumping is more than just report and removal. OPW applies a three-pronged strategy when tackling dumping – eradication, education, and enforcement.

The use of cameras to strengthen enforcement is key to the City's goal of holding individuals and companies responsible for illegally dumping over 150,000 lbs of material in Oakland neighborhoods annually. The City proposed employing a surveillance system called the POD, which the Privacy Advisory Commission (PAC) approved with some recommended amendments.

BACKGROUND / LEGISLATIVE HISTORY

On December 2, 2021, the City's Privacy Committee unanimously approved OPW's proposed use of surveillance cameras in the public right of way in or around illegal dumping hotspots (see proposed Use Policy, *Attachment A*), with the following three amendments:

1) Repeat in the Use Policy the following reporting clause from the Impact Statement, Section E. Mitigations:

OPW shall report within 72 hours any Oakland Police Department (OPD) request for video recordings captured by POD units to the Chief Privacy Officer and Privacy Advisory Commission (PAC) Chair. OPD's request will describe the nature of the investigation for which the video data is being requested. This information will be reported to the PAC at its next regularly scheduled meeting.

2) In the Use Policy, under Third-Party Data Sharing: include the following Approved Policy as presented at the meeting:

In the event POD cameras capture general illegal activity that reasonably appears to constitute "violent forcible crimes" as defined by OPD's Departmental General Order J-04 – Pursuit Driving Appendix A, Paragraph H: "Violent Forcible Crime," Environmental Enforcement Unit (EEU) staff shall promptly download the relevant video footage, forward said recording to OPD for possible investigatory and enforcement action, and log the incident. This log shall be incorporated into the annual report required by O.M.C. [Oakland Municipal Code] 9.64.040

3) In the Use Policy, under Authorized Uses: include the following Approved Policy as presented at the meeting:

Absent a specific written waiver from affected property owners or current residents, City staff shall use the masking features to obscure areas not in the public right of way. A record of waivers shall be included in the annual report.

Cameras will be a valuable tool for OPW's six Environmental Enforcement Officers (EEOs) to hold illegal dumpers accountable. In the FY 2021-23 budget, the City Council authorized \$100,000 in Fund 2270, Project #1005964 for the purchase of cameras to support EEOs in their effort to deter illegal dumping on Oakland city streets. The City's goal is to install cameras near chronic dumping hotspots and use the video evidence to identify dumpers or produce supporting information needed to build credible cases for prosecution. Staff believes there will be an immediate mitigating effect on illegal dumping because the video evidence will lead to prosecutions and convictions.

OPW staff reviewed several video camera systems, and after consultation with the PAC Ad Hoc Committee, staff selected the following video surveillance system – the POD system.



The POD is an all-in-one, portable surveillance system. It comes in two basic models. The i4POD-P/ i4POD-S has four (4) cameras; the i2POD has two (2) cameras. Both models include a digital video recorder (DVR), a cellular router, and a wifi transmitter housed in an easy-to-move and mount enclosure. The POD is plug and play; the City needs only to supply 110v power to activate the system. A quick summary of the POD's features is provided below, but detailed information provided to the City's Privacy Advisory Commission is available in *Attachment B* – the Impact Report.

- Cameras do not use Artificial Intelligence (AI) to analyze license plate information. All license plate information will be captured manually (visually) by the authorized user. NOTE: Oakland Municipal Codes permit EEOs to cite both the dumper *and* the vehicle's owner used in a dumping incident.
- Routine video recordings not downloaded will be purged automatically and permanently by the DVR every 14 days when new video is saved over the oldest recordings.

- Since its introduction in 2009, the POD surveillance system has never been hacked. POD DVRs are Linux-based, and downloaded video is encrypted. Video recordings cannot be played using standard video players (e.g., Windows Media Player). Please refer to "*Data Access*" for the multi-level security measures required to access POD systems.
- OPW will retain and use license plate information and video footage strictly for the enforcement of illegal dumping and will only forward footage containing illegal dumping activities to the City Attorney, assigned Hearing Officer, OPD and/or Alameda County's District Attorney's Office for prosecution.

Security Lines U.S. is the sole source manufacturer and distributor of the POD system. There are other cameras on the market, but the POD by Security Lines U.S. is the only plug-and-play surveillance camera system that incorporates an onboard digital recorder with a 2TB hard drive, Pan-Tilt-Zoom lenses, and an optional infrared floodlight that can all be accessed remotely. I4-PODs have four lenses and can provide multiple views of hotspots, while I2-PODs with two lenses can be placed on narrower streets where an illegal dumper has limited ingress and egress. The cameras can also be programmed to block out private property that may be in a location that is close to the public right of way. Finally, PODs do not store license plate data.

San Leandro, Sacramento, Fremont, Alameda, Livermore, and Milpitas are just a few of the regional municipalities using the POD surveillance system. In October 2021, OPW staff solicited product reviews from the City of Alameda and the City of Livermore. Both cities gave full endorsements for the product. Key features of the POD system that garnered positive reviews were:

- Tamper-proof housing unit: weather-tested, near-indestructible casing
- Easy set-up: system only requires 110v power, mounting bracket, and mounting straps to install
- Mobile: easy to move the unit to other locations
- Reliability: minimal downtime with stable cellular service
- Minimal maintenance: simple design makes for minimal maintenance
- Simple to use
- Clean, crisp video images

Neither Security Line U.S. nor the POD system has experienced any data breach since its introduction in 2009.

At an upcoming January 2022 City Council meeting, OPW staff will seek Council approval to acquire ten (10) POD units and deploy them at the City's most active hotspots (as determined by dumping data from OPW's work management system,

Cityworks.) The POD units will undergo a two-month trial period to ensure the cameras are effective at curbing illegal dumping. Following a successful trial, staff will request funding through the FY22-23 Midcycle Budget development process to acquire more POD units. Staff will also request approval to hire one Administrative Assistant II to support the added administrative duties in the EEU as the OPW Illegal Dumping Surveillance Camera Program becomes fully operational.

FISCAL IMPACT

This item is for informational purposes only and does not have a direct fiscal impact.

PUBLIC OUTREACH / INTEREST

No outreach was deemed necessary for the proposed policy action beyond the standard City Council agenda noticing procedures because this is an Informational Report.

SUSTAINABLE OPPORTUNITIES

Economic: When the City and the community work together to keep waste off the streets, it lessens the burden of unnecessary costs associated with discarding it.

Environmental: Enforcement of existing laws to eliminate illegally dumped material on City streets improves the health and safety of the community. It enhances the aesthetics and makes the City more habitable.

Race & Equity: Illegal dumping often occurs in disadvantaged neighborhoods, and the use of surveillance cameras in illegal dumping hotspots provides additional enforcement to support keeping underprivileged communities clean. However, this is an oral report with no action requested; therefore, there are no Race and Equity opportunities associated with this Informational Report. The City will continue to analyze data and address all race and equity issues associated with the deployment of surveillance cameras at illegal dumping hotspots.

ACTION REQUESTED OF THE CITY COUNCIL

Staff Recommends That The Public Works Committee Receive An Informational Report On The Use Of Cameras To Monitor Illegal Dumping Hot Spots Throughout The City Of Oakland.

For questions regarding this report, please contact G. Harold Duffey, Public Works Director, at (510) 238-4470.

Respectfully submitted,

G. HAROLD DUFFE

Director, Oakland Public Works

Reviewed by: Frank Foster, Acting Assistant Director BOE, OPW

Prepared by: Victoria Chak, Administrative Services Manager BOE, OPW

Attachments (2):

A. Use Policy

B. Impact Report

Public Works Committee December 14, 2021