



CITY OF OAKLAND

AGENDA REPORT

TO: Jestin D. Johnson
City Administrator

FROM: Damon Covington
Chief, Oakland Fire Dept

SUBJECT: FY 22-2023 Quarterly Overtime
Report from the Oakland Fire
Department

DATE: November 23, 2023

City Administrator Approval


Jestin Johnson (Nov 30, 2023 21:51 PST)

Date: Nov 30, 2023

RECOMMENDATION

Staff Recommends That The City Council Receive An Informational Report From The Oakland Fire Department On The Use Of Overtime During The Third Quarter Of Fiscal Year 2022-2023 (FY 22-23), That Includes Additional Information On Overtime Policy, Use, And Accountability.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This informational report provides data on the Oakland Fire Department's (OFD) overtime policy, use, and accountability through the third quarter of FY 2022-23, overspending above the City Council Adopted Budget continued, primarily attributed to overtime costs in public safety. Total all funds, OFDs overtime spending, fiscal year to date through March 31, 2022, was \$24,561,893.

BACKGROUND / LEGISLATIVE HISTORY

On October 24, 2017, Oakland Fire Department staff presented a report titled, "Fiscal Year (FY) 2016-17 Fourth Quarter Revenue and Expenditure Results and Year-End Summaries for the General Purpose Fund (GPF) and Eight (8) Selected Funds; and GPF Carryforward for FY 2017-18; and Overtime Analysis for All Funds" to the Finance and Management Committee.

Following the initial report, OFD has presented periodic reports on departmental overtime. The most recent overtime report was provided in the form of an informational memo in July 2022.

Per Ordinance No. [13487 C.M.S.](#), if a department is projected to overspend in the GPF by more than one percent (1%), that department must provide an action plan to the City Administrator. The City Administrator shall bring an Informational Report to the City Council within sixty (60) days following acceptance of the Revenue and Expenditure (R&E) report by the City Council. The report shall list the actions the Administration is taking to bring the expenditures into alignment with the budget.

This report also details how OFD aims to control overtime expenditures with real actionable changes to policies, procedures, and processes, and corresponding accountability mechanisms.

ANALYSIS AND POLICY ALTERNATIVES

This informational report advances the citywide priority of being a responsive, trustworthy government by demonstrating how city departments using their funding, or in some cases exceeding their budgeted funding allotment, and why.

Oakland Fire Department Authorized Staffing

OFD operates twenty-five (25) fire stations located throughout the city, twenty-four (24) hours per day, seven (7) days per week. OFD is responsible for fire and medical dispatch, fire prevention, fire suppression, mitigation, emergency medical response, specialized rescue operations, fire investigation, emergency management, and fire code inspection within the city.

Currently, OFD has five hundred and thirty-four (534.00) Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) sworn personnel and two hundred four and eighty-eight hundredths (204.88) FTE civilian personnel authorized, for a total of seven hundred thirty-eight and eighty-eight hundredths (738.88) FTE. Sixteen of the 534.00 FTE sworn personnel are allocated as 40-hr staff positions.

Operationally, OFD fire suppression shift staff are organized into three (3) shifts referred to as A, B, and C Shifts. Shift positions operate on a 48/96 schedule whereby members work two (2) shifts (48-Hours) followed by four (4) days off.

Fire Suppression Minimum Staffing

The Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between the City of Oakland (City) and the International Association of Fire Fighters, Local 55 (Local 55), guides the working conditions of the represented OFD sworn personnel. Additionally, OFD provides Aircraft Rescue Firefighting (ARFF) Services at the Oakland International Airport under the terms of an MOU between the City and the Port of Oakland (Port).

Section 4.2.4 of the MOU between the City and Local 55 identified, through the year 2027, daily minimum staffing levels for "Fire Suppression Staffing" of OFD sworn personnel. The MOU minimum staffing sets a daily number of sworn staff, broken out by specific ranks, which must be in the field at any given time. The total suppression staffing equates to one hundred and thirty-seven (137.00) FTE sworn personnel per shift and four hundred and eleven (411.00) FTE sworn personnel to cover all three (3) shifts. This staffing level includes the ARFF staffing requirements of a minimum of six (6.00) FTE sworn personnel one (1.00) FTE Captain and five (5.00) FTE Firefighters).

OFD sworn personnel operate using a "chain of command" or "rank" system.

Table 1 shows the Department's sworn rank organizational structure by job classification:

Table 1. Sworn Ranks

<u>Rank</u>
Fire Chief
Deputy Chief of Fire Department
Assistant Chief of Fire Department
Fire Marshal (Sworn)
Battalion Chief
Assistant Fire Marshal (Sworn)
Captain of Fire Department
Lieutenant of Fire Department
Fire Investigator
Engineer of Fire Department
Firefighter-Paramedic
Firefighter

Table 2 below shows the minimum fire suppression staffing by rank required based upon these two (2) MOUs.

Table 2. Fire Suppression Minimum Staffing By Shift & FTE

Rank	Number of FTE			
	A Shift	B Shift	C Shift	Total A, B & C Shift Staffing
Battalion Chief	3.00	3.00	3.00	9.00
Captain of Fire Department	14.00	13.00	14.00	41.00
Lieutenant of Fire Department	18.00	19.00	18.00	55.00
Engineer of Fire Department	24.00	24.00	24.00	72.00
Fire Investigator	1.00	1.00	1.00	3.00
Firefighter-Paramedic	26.00	26.00	26.00	78.00
Firefighter	51.00	51.00	51.00	153.00
Total Minimum Staffing	137.00	137.00	137.00	411.00

Sworn personnel are assigned daily as follows:

- Three (3) Battalions staffed, with 1.0 FTE Battalion Chief each
- Twenty-four (24) Engine Companies, each staffed with a minimum of 1.0 FTE Officer, 1.0 FTE Engineer, 1.0 FTE Firefighter-Paramedic and 1.0 FTE Firefighter
- One (1) Aircraft Rescue Firefighter (ARFF) company staffed with a minimum of 1.0 FTE Captain and 5.0 FTE Firefighters
- Seven (7) Truck Companies staffed as follows:
 - Three (3) Truck companies with a minimum of 1.0 FTE Captain and (3) three Firefighters;

- One (1) Truck company with a minimum of 1.0 FTE Captain, 1.0 FTE Firefighter-Paramedic and 2.0 FTE Firefighters;
- Two (2) Truck companies with a minimum of 1.0 FTE Captain and 4.0 FTE Firefighters;
- One (1) Truck company staffed with a minimum of 1.0 FTE Captain, 1.0 FTE Firefighter-Paramedic and 3.0 FTE Firefighters; and
- 1.0 FTE Fire Investigator.

The positions shown in **Table 2** above are the minimum number of sworn positions per shift.

However, achieving this daily staffing level is hampered by the following:

- Vacancies;
- "40-Hour" Staff Assignments;
- Training;
- Vacation;
- Injuries;
- Deployments; and
- Other time off.

Oakland Fire Department 3rd Quarter of Fiscal Year 2022-23 Budgeted Overtime Funding By Fund

The Department budgeted a total of \$13,568,454 for overtime in FY 2022-23. **Table 3** shows the Department's FY 2022-23 overtime budget by Fund:

Table 3. Budgeted Funding for Overtime Expenditures By Fund

FUND	FY 2022-23 BUDGET
1010 - General Fund: General Purpose	\$11,120,014
2123 - US Dept of Homeland Security	\$10,375
2124 - Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA)	\$65,373
2252 - Meas. Z - Violence Prevention& Public Safety Act of 2014	\$2,000,000
2412 - Meas. M - Alameda Co.: Emer. Dispatch Srv. Suppl.l Assessment	\$288,154
2415 - Development Service Fund	\$59,164
3100 - Sewer Service Fund	\$21,394
4600 - Information Technology	\$3,980
Grand Total	\$13,568,454

Table 4 below shows the Department’s funding sources for budgeted and actual overtime, by Fund and Organization:

Table 4. Dedicated Funding for Overtime Expenditures and Actuals by Fund & Organization

FUND	FIRE DEPARTMENT ORGANIZATION	FY 2022-23 BUDGET	FY 2022-23 Q1, Q2 & Q3 ACTUAL
1010 - General Fund: General Purpose			
	20241 - Fire Communications	\$16,067	\$192,775
	20251 - Communications Emergency Dispatch	\$67,285	\$160,573
	20341 - Arson Investigation	\$9,042	\$150,704
	20371 - Vegetation Management	\$148,700	\$9,698
	20411 - Emergency / Suppression: Shift A	\$10,775,422	\$20,341,222
	20511 - Budget Planning: Administration	\$1,713	\$1,972
	20551 - Time and Attendance	\$0	\$236
	20611 - Education and Training: Administration	\$0	\$550
	20631 - In-Service Training	\$21,005	\$58,786
	20711 - Emergency Services Program	\$19,878	\$25,641
	20814 - Fire: Airport	\$57,593	\$1,666,246
	20816 - Fire: Support Services	\$3,309	\$3,416
	20914 - MACRO	\$0	\$25
	1010 - General Fund: General Purpose Total	\$11,120,014	\$22,611,845
2123 - US Dept of Homeland Security			
	20711 - Emergency Services Program	\$10,375	\$10,375
	2123 - US Dept of Homeland Security Total	\$10,375	\$10,375
2124 - Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA)			
	20411 - Emergency / Suppression: Shift A	\$64,059	\$1,545
	20815 - Fire: U.S.A.R.	\$1,314	\$6,057
	2124 - Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) Total	\$65,373	\$7,602
2159 - State of California Other			
	20311 - Fire Marshal's Office	\$0	\$1,606
	20331 - Inspectional Services	\$0	\$5,391
	20914 - MACRO	\$0	\$42,706
	2159 - State of California Other Total	\$0	\$49,703
2160 - County of Alameda: Grants			
	20913 - EMS Training	\$0	\$463
	2160 - County of Alameda: Grants Total	\$0	\$463
2252 - Meas. Z - Violence Prevention & Public Safety Act of 2014			
	20411 - Emergency / Suppression: Shift A	\$2,000,000	\$1,500,000
	2252 - Meas. Z - Violence Prevention & Public Safety Act of 2014 Total	\$2,000,000	\$1,500,000
2412 - Meas. M - Alameda Co.: Emer. Dispatch Srvc. Suppl. Assessment			
	20251 - Communications Emergency Dispatch	\$288,154	\$175,015
	2412 - Meas. M - Alameda Co.: Emer. Dispatch Srvc. Suppl. Assessment	\$288,154	\$175,015
2415 - Development Service Fund			
	20311 - Fire Marshal's Office	\$1,844	\$29,311
	20331 - Inspectional Services	\$57,320	\$57,614
	20351 - Engineering	\$0	\$104,658
	2415 - Development Service Fund Total	\$59,164	\$191,583
3100 - Sewer Service Fund			
	20251 - Communications Emergency Dispatch	\$21,394	\$15,245
	3100 - Sewer Service Fund Total	\$21,394	\$15,245
4600 - Information Technology			
	20241 - Fire Communications	\$3,980	\$62
	4600 - Information Technology Total	\$3,980	\$62
Grand Total		\$13,568,454	\$24,561,893

Actual Third Quarter of FY 2022-23 OFD Overtime Hours & Costs

Table 5 below shows the Department's total overtime hours and costs during the third quarter of FY 2022-23 by Sworn rank:

Table 5. Third Quarter FY 2022-23 OFD Actual Overtime Hours & Costs

Overtime Cost - 1st Quarter FY 2022-23 (07/01/22 - 09/30/22)		
Sworn Rank	OT Hours	Overtime Cost
Battalion Chief	2,277	\$267,759
Captain of Fire Department	10,466	\$1,050,822
Lieutenant of Fire Department	14,446	\$1,320,817
Fire Investigator	301	\$26,610
Engineer of Fire Department	20,731	\$1,803,778
Fire Fighter Paramedic	12,885	\$1,084,816
Fire Fighter	36,486	\$2,852,456
Total 1st QTR Sworn OT	97,592	\$8,407,058
Total 1st QTR Civilian OT	3,803	\$293,303
TOTAL 1st QTR OFD OT	101,395	\$8,700,362
Overtime Cost - 2nd Quarter FY 2022-23 (10/01/22 - 12/31/22)		
Sworn Rank	OT Hours	Overtime Cost
Battalion Chief	2,985	\$337,953
Captain of Fire Department	9,654	\$946,140
Lieutenant of Fire Department	12,050	\$1,079,860
Fire Investigator	790	\$68,130
Engineer of Fire Department	17,274	\$1,482,155
Fire Fighter Paramedic	10,446	\$863,852
Fire Fighter	35,395	\$2,713,025
Total 2nd QTR Sworn OT	88,594	\$7,491,116
Total 2nd QTR Civilian OT	2,871	\$280,128
TOTAL 2nd QTR OFD OT	91,465	\$7,771,244
Overtime Cost - 3rd Quarter FY 2022-23 (01/01/2023 - 03/31/2023)		
Sworn Rank	OT Hours	Overtime Cost
Battalion Chief	2,959	\$351,606
Captain of Fire Department	10,016	\$1,012,568
Lieutenant of Fire Department	11,912	\$1,111,746
Fire Investigator	624	\$55,964
Engineer of Fire Department	15,479	\$1,375,968
Fire Fighter Paramedic	11,874	\$1,002,921
Fire Fighter	37,017	\$2,917,242
Total 3rd QTR Sworn OT	89,881	\$7,828,016
Total 3rd QTR Civilian OT	508	\$262,271
TOTAL 2nd QTR OFD OT	90,389	\$8,090,287
TOTAL 1st, 2nd & 3rd Quarter FY 2022-23 OFD Overtime	283,248	\$24,561,893

Ongoing Efforts to Identify and Reduce Overtime Usage

Unless the overtime in fire suppression pertains to a backfill of staffing due to leave, illness, or injury, all overtime requests must be approved by the Chief of the Fire Department.

While much of the overtime usage for OFD is in Operations, not all overtime in Operations overtime is specific to backfill. Overtime can also be triggered by Red Flag Warning days, lasting between 12-72 hours, Public Safety Power Shutoff events, Emergency Operations Center activations, and other special events where OFD is called to participate or prepare.

Since January 2021, OFD has graduated 74 new and lateral recruits. They are all currently working at their assigned stations, some still on a probationary basis, offsetting the need for overtime and mandatory backfill.

The Department plans to hire approximately 35 additional members by the end of 2023.

Beginning in October 2018, OFD began working with the Finance and Information Technology departments to add a more detailed level of time codes to provide for overtime tracking that can readily identify overtime by type, such as Field Operations Minimum Staffing, Red Flag Days, Academy Cadre, Callback, Mutual Aid, Other Deployment Backfill, Training, Special Projects, etc. It is anticipated this will aid in identifying operational needs to better control and reduce overtime.

The Fire Dispatch Center (FDC) relies on the guidance and recommendations of the National Emergency Number Association (NENA), which works with 9-1-1 professionals nationwide, public policy leaders, and emergency services and telecommunications industry partners to develop and carry out critical programs, staffing criteria, and initiatives in line with industry leading standards, training, and certifications.

Several other events or circumstances also may trigger the use of overtime, including:

- Emergency Recall Incidents (covering any call back of sworn staff such as a Safety Officer or Assistant Sworn Fire Marshal having to work after hours – or up staffing an engine during an unanticipated emergency event).
- Incidents that happen at shift change will usually require OT to allow for the exchange of personnel at the incident.
- Backfill for members assigned to special projects (Computer Aided Dispatch, Accela, Drill Tower, etc.).
- Backfilling apparatus committee to allow them to perform other departmental roles and responsibilities outside of suppression.
- Backfilling for other approved travel such as training, conferences, and meetings out of the area.

The proud men and women of the Oakland Fire Department are committed to providing the highest quality of courteous and responsive services to the residents of Oakland.

Staff continuously evaluate these strategies and personnel to ensure that OFD promotes and represents current best practices to increase the efficiency and effectiveness of the department. All Bureau Chiefs and Division Managers are encouraged to utilize all available tools and metrics to evaluate the goals, objectives, costs, and outcomes for their respective division.

FISCAL IMPACT

The practice of paying employees to work overtime can be a cost-effective tool for dealing with staffing fluctuations and personnel shortages. Excessive and prolonged overtime usage can, however, adversely affect an organization's financial resources, not to mention the person life and behavioral health of fire personnel.

PUBLIC OUTREACH / INTEREST

There is no public outreach required pertaining to the acceptance of this report.

COORDINATION

The Fire Department coordinated with the Budget Bureau to complete this report.

SUSTAINABLE OPPORTUNITIES

Economic: There are no economic opportunities associated with this report.

Environmental: There are no environmental impacts related to this report.

Race & Equity: There are no race and equity impacts related to the acceptance of this report.

ACTION REQUESTED OF THE CITY COUNCIL

Staff Recommends That The City Council Receive An Informational Report From The Oakland Fire Department On The Use Of Overtime During the Third Quarter Of Fiscal Year 2022-2023 (FY 22-2023), That Includes Additional Information on Overtime Policy, Use, and Accountability.

For questions regarding this report, please contact Michael Hunt, OFD Chief of Staff, at mhunt@oaklandca.gov, and Gene Tom, OFD Chief Financial Officer at GTom@oaklandca.gov.

Respectfully submitted,



Damon Covington
Fire Chief

Prepared by: Michael Hunt, OFD Chief of Staff, and Gene Tom, OFD Chief Financial Officer