



CITY OF OAKLAND

FILED
OFFICE OF THE CITY CLERK
OAKLAND

2017 NOV -2 AM 10:20

AGENDA REPORT

TO: Sabrina B. Landreth
City Administrator

FROM: Jason Mitchell
Director, Public Works

SUBJECT: Report Regarding City Hall Security
Enhancements

DATE: October 23, 2017

City Administrator Approval

Date:

11/1/17

RECOMMENDATION

Staff Recommends That The City Council Accept A Report with Recommendations To Select One Of Two Options To Enhance Security At City Hall, And Direct Oakland Public Works (OPW) To Work With The Finance Department To Identify Funding.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to respond to the City Council request for security options that address safety concerns by enhancing the existing security procedures at City Hall.

BACKGROUND / LEGISLATIVE HISTORY

At the Public Works Committee on September 12, 2017, the Committee directed staff to prepare a report providing options on heightening security at City Hall and the cost associated with the enhancements.

Currently security at City Hall is provided by unarmed private security officers, a closed-circuit television system (cameras at main entrances), and some limited elevator access through the card reader access system. City employees and visitors pass by a security officer at or near the entrances to City Hall. Visitors are required to sign in at the guard desk, except if entering City Hall for a meeting.

The nearby State, Federal and County Buildings have full screening processes for visitors and employees in place as a standard security measure. The screening includes walk-through metal detectors and x-ray baggage scanning equipment.

Item: _____
Public Works Committee
November 14, 2017

ANALYSIS AND POLICY ALTERNATIVES

Two security enhancement options are presented in this report. Both options include screening stations comprised of a walk-through metal detector, x-ray baggage scanning equipment, and two handheld body scanners. Each screening station would be staffed by three Unarmed Security Guards and one Oakland Police Officer. A three-guard team is required to operate a screening station and is in line with the accepted industry standards: one guard to monitor the x-ray baggage scanning equipment; another guard to direct visitors and employees through the walk-through metal detectors; and the third guard to assist with the handheld body scanners and to help with retrieving belongings from the x-ray scanning area.

Option 1 offers two screening stations from 8:00 am to 4:00 pm (Shift A) and one screening station from 3:30 pm to 11:00 pm (Shift B). Shift A has a screening station at the 14th Street entrance and at the 15th Street entrance. Shift B has one screening station at the 14th Street entrance. The total estimated cost for Option 1 is \$995,500.

Option 2 has one screening station from 8:00 am to 4:00 pm (Shift A) and one screening station from 3:30 pm to 11:00 pm (Shift B). Each shift only uses a screening station at the 14th Street entrance. The total estimated cost for Option 2 is \$701,500.

Both options will help deter potential weapons or other harmful items from entering the building thereby the potential for acts of threats, violence, or vandalism. Entry doors without screening stations will be closed, including the front door to City Hall. All employees and visitors will be required to enter through the screened doors.

Benefits and Drawbacks of Each Security Enhancement Option

Option 1

Because Option 1 has two screening stations, either one of the stations can provide immediate backup if the other station breaks down or needs regular scheduled maintenance. Option 1 is also more convenient for staff and visitors because it provides two screened entrances into the building and helps to minimize waiting in line as employees and visitors are screened.

Option 2

Although Option 2 only includes one screening station, it still addresses the safety concerns and the cost is \$294,000 (or 30%) less than Option 1. Additionally, the backup equipment will help to reduce the loss of operational time if the equipment breaks down or requires servicing. However, having only one screening station may result in longer lines at peak hours or during City Council meeting days.

The charts below summarize each option. Equipment costs do not factor in the cost of electrical upgrades, building alterations, review and approval by the Fire Marshall or American Disabilities Act (ADA) requirements. Also, the estimated cost is based on a regular daily schedule of 8:00 am to 11:00 pm and does not include overtime rates for meetings lasting beyond 11:00 pm.

Each option will require funding identification and appropriation to proceed. Once the City Council has selected an option, OPW will work with the Finance Department to identify funding.

OPTION 1 Security Enhancement

Item Description	Estimated Cost
Equipment: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Install two (2) Walk-through Metal Detectors: one at the 14th Street entrance and one at the 15th Street entrance • Provide two (2) Handheld Body Scanners at each of the 2 entrances (total of 4 scanners) • Install two (2) x-ray baggage scanning equipment - one at the 14th Street entrance and one at the 15th Street entrance 	Equipment Cost \$107,000
Operations & Maintenance (O&M) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service contract for regular maintenance of equipment 	O&M Annual Cost \$25,000
Unarmed Security Guards: <u>Shift A:</u> 8:00 am – 4:00 pm (2 screening stations) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 guards at each of the screening stations (total of 6 guards) <u>Shift B:</u> 3:30 pm – 11:00 pm (1 screening station only) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 guards at 14th Street entrance 	Security Guard Annual Cost \$403,500
Oakland Police Department Officers <u>Shift A:</u> 8:00 am – 4:00 pm (2 screening stations) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 police officer at each of the screening stations (total of 2 officers) <u>Shift B:</u> 3:30 pm – 11:00 pm (1 screening station only) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 police officer at 14th Street entrance 	Police Officer Annual Cost \$460,000
Total Annual Cost	\$995,500

OPTION 2 Security Enhancement

Item Description	Estimated Cost
Equipment:	Equipment Cost \$107,000
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Install one (1) Walk-through Metal Detector at the 14th Street entrance Provide two (2) Handheld Body Scanners at 14th Street entrance • Install one (1) x-ray baggage scanning equipment at the 14th Street entrance • Back-up equipment (metal detector, handheld body scanners and x-ray baggage scanning equipment) 	
Operations and Maintenance (O&M)	O&M Annual Cost \$25,000
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service contract for regular maintenance of equipment 	
Unarmed Security Guards:	Security Guard Annual Cost \$266,000
<u>Shift A:</u> 8:00 am – 4:00 pm (1 screening station only) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 guards at the screening station 	
<u>Shift B:</u> 3:30 pm – 11:00 pm (1 screening station only) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 guards at 14th Street entrance 	
Oakland Police Department Officers	Police Officer Annual Cost \$303,500
<u>Shift A:</u> 8:00 am – 4:00 pm (1 screening station only) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 police officer at 14th Street entrance 	
<u>Shift B:</u> 3:30 pm – 11:00 pm (1 screening station only) 1 police officer at 14 th Street entrance	
Total Annual Cost	\$701,500

FISCAL IMPACT

This report is for informational purposes only and does not have a direct fiscal impact.

PUBLIC OUTREACH / INTEREST

No public outreach was deemed necessary for this informational report.

COORDINATION

The report was prepared in coordination with the Oakland Police Department and the Office of the City Attorney.

SUSTAINABLE OPPORTUNITIES

Economic: Security enhancements will help to reduce costs from vandalism and other destructive actions.

Environmental: There are no environmental opportunities.

Social Equity: Enhanced security in City Hall will facilitate a safer environment for residents, visitors and employees.

ACTION REQUESTED OF THE CITY COUNCIL

Staff Recommends That The City Council Accept A Report with Recommendation To Select One Of Two Options To Enhance Security At City Hall, And Direct Oakland Public Works (OPW) To Work With The Finance Department To Identify Funding.

For questions regarding this report, please contact Andrienne Rogers, Administrative Services Manager, at 510-615-5446.

Respectfully submitted,



JASON MITCHELL
Director, Oakland Public Works Department

Reviewed by:
Susan Kattchee, Assistant Director
Bureau of Facilities and Environment

Prepared by:
Andrienne Rogers
Administrative Services Manager
Bureau of Facilities and Environment