



CITY OF OAKLAND

AGENDA REPORT


TO: Jestin D. Johnson
City Administrator

FROM: Ashleigh Kanat
Director, Economic &
Workforce Development

SUBJECT: Security Camera Professional
Services Agreement in Districts 6
and 7

DATE: June 7, 2024

City Administrator Approval


Jestin Johnson (Jun 21, 2024 06:44 PDT)

Date: Jun 21, 2024

RECOMMENDATION

Staff Recommends That The City Council Adopt A Resolution Awarding A Professional Services Agreement With Applied Video Solutions, Inc. In An Amount Not To Exceed \$150,000 For A Two-year Period To Strengthen The Hegenberger Commercial Corridor And Surrounding Areas In East Oakland Through A Security Camera Network Program And Waiving The Competitive Advertising And Request For Proposals/Qualifications Requirements And The Local/Small Business Enterprise Program Requirements

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

On June 24, 2021, the City Council adopted Resolution [No. 88717 C.M.S.](#) and appropriated \$150,000 to fund safety cameras along business corridors in East Oakland. The security camera network program is in response to requests from business owners and residents in the identified areas by implementing a systematic approach to strengthen business corridors in East Oakland. The purpose of this program is to support the revitalization of historically underinvested commercial corridors by using tools that will help increase safety for residents, shoppers, employees, and business owners along the Hegenberger Commercial Corridor and the surrounding areas in East Oakland. .

Staff recommend entering into a grant agreement with Applied Video Solutions, Inc. (AVS), to establish the "Safe City Network," a camera network that improves coordination and communication amongst network users, namely the business and property owners that own the cameras and can share information that is critical to sustaining public safety.

BACKGROUND / LEGISLATIVE HISTORY

Resolution No. 88717 C.M.S., as amended and adopted on June 24, 2021, appropriated \$150,000 to fund security cameras along key business corridors in Council District 6 and Council District 7. The program was created in response to the requests of business owners and residents in the identified areas to help strengthen business corridors in East Oakland

City Council
June 18, 2024

through a security camera program as part of a comprehensive public safety strategy. The purpose of this program is to support the revitalization of historically underinvested commercial corridors by increasing safety for residents, shoppers, employees, and business owners.

The Economic and Workforce Development Department (EWDD) researched the history of similar City programs, such as the Oakland Public Works (OPW) Illegal Dumping Surveillance Camera Program and Oakland Police Department (OPD) Security Camera Registration Program. Staff also researched the steps necessary to address the privacy concerns raised by surveillance camera programs. Based on the results of the research, staff determined that the optimal program design is a Security Camera Grant Program (Program) in which funds are granted to an equipment vendor (Intermediary) with ties to the impacted areas, who will purchase security cameras to be granted to businesses (Recipients) and place them on their private property along the identified commercial corridors.

Recipients would be selected based on a data-driven approach in partnership with the professional services provider and in coordination with OPD intelligence and crime data. Recipients would receive connection services to the online/Cloud-based service for the installed cameras, as well as one (1) in-person training session on how to use the cameras, including viewing video footage and how to be responsible for ongoing maintenance. AVS, a current vendor working in other areas of the City to establish the “Safe City Network” would provide a two-year help desk support service as part of the agreement. Video footage is for business use and only shared with City on a voluntary basis in conjunction with a reported crime. In addition to utilizing the Safe City network, businesses will be encouraged to register the Camera with the City’s Camera registration program; <https://www.oaklandca.gov/services/register-your-security-camera>.

The Registry allows residents and business owners to register the locations of their video security systems with OPD. OPD will then be able to see where the cameras are located. If a Recipient registers a camera, OPD will contact them if video footage is sought in connection to a criminal investigation. This program was reviewed by the PAC when it was first introduced, and it does not pose significant privacy concerns because the OPD is not the owner of the data, it merely knows where to seek data when a crime has been committed.

On December 2, 2021, the Privacy Advisory Commission (PAC) unanimously approved OPW’s proposed use of surveillance cameras in the public right of way in or around illegal dumping hotspots. The OPW Illegal Dumping Surveillance Program involved the direct use of City staff to monitor the surveillance cameras for illegal dumping activity. Because this program does involve the City gathering significant surveillance data, there was an extensive process developing a refined Use Policy with the PAC that puts important safeguards in place to protect people’s privacy.

Following the May 17, 2021 informational report providing an update on the implementation of this program presented to the Community and Economic Development Committee, staff presented an item to the PAC to receive feedback and comment on the proposed program. The City Attorney determined that the Surveillance Technology Ordinance rules do not apply to this proposal since City staff will not be obtaining the cameras for City use and will not be regularly receiving the data from cameras provided to recipients.

Hegenberger Corridor As A Regional Gateway

District 7 is a strong engine in Oakland’s economy anchored by the San Francisco Bay International Airport (OAK). The Port of Oakland’s 2023 Annual Report stated OAK generates \$497 million in state and local taxes annually. OAK reported serving 11.2 million passengers in 2023, an increase of 0.8 percent compared to 2022. The visitor-serving industry, made up hotel, restaurant and retail store jobs, are generated by purchases from the millions of visitors that travel through OAK. The positive economic impacts from OAK include over 30,000 direct jobs and generating \$1.6 billion in economic impact according to the [Port’s 2023 Annual Report](#).

The Hegenberger area supplies not only Oakland International Airport but also the logistics and trucking industries that use the 880 Freeway into and through Oakland. The Hegenberger area also houses in-demand industrial lands, which continue to boast low vacancy rates (4%) and command competitive rents. Industrial lands are a regional asset, and they continue to be in high demand.

In addition to the impact of the airport, International Boulevard is a main throughfare through the city connecting the area to the rest of Oakland and surrounding cities. Legacy businesses, defined as businesses in operation for over 30 years, still line the corridor. The Hegenberger corridor’s business community is comprised of both smaller and corporate businesses, necessitating an economic and business development strategy with distinct goals and features that support these varied yet important job and revenue generating functions.

The consistent request from small and large businesses over the past year has been to stabilize the economic operating environment. With an industrial legacy and as a gateway for travelers to the region, reports from businesses in the Hegenberger area focused on the need for immediate investment in cleanliness and safety as a core principle of business attraction and retention.

Impacts of Public Safety on Commercial Corridors in East Oakland

The safety and security of commercial business corridors is a priority for businesses as the City continues to recover from the COVID-19 pandemic, particularly for businesses in East Oakland that have seen a dramatic increase in reported crimes during the past several years. **Table 1** presents crime data from the past two years in the areas of Central and Deep East Oakland where this camera network would be deployed. The areas highlighted in yellow are in East Oakland with some areas experiencing double digit crime increases over the past two years.

Table 1: Crime Trends, Number of Service Calls Due to Criminal Activity in Portions of Police Beat Areas 4 and 5 Surrounding Hegenberger Corridor

Police Beat	FY 2021-22	FY 2022-23	% Change
13Z - Montclair/Piedmont Pines/Central Hills	306	352	15.03%
16X - Lakeshore Ave./Trestle Glen/Crocker Highlands	132	170	28.79%
20X - Jingletown/portion of Fruitvale District	727	859	18.16%
21Y - Upper Fruitvale	456	568	24.56%

27X - Fairfax	421	469	11.40%
27Y - Seminary	501	607	21.16%
30X - Havenscourt/ Arroyo Viejo	553	587	6.15%
34X - Elmhurst	392	407	3.83%

Waiver of Competitive Bid Process

EWD secured informal bids from three area companies identified through inter-departmental sources, including existing City vendors. EWD selected AVS/SafeCity Connect due to its competitive pricing and partnership with a Local Business Enterprise to procure the camera equipment. AVS/SafeCity Connect is the vendor of choice for the Uptown/Downtown Business Improvement District and is currently providing its Cloud-based network to integrate 400 cameras in the Downtown area.

AVS/SafeCity Connect's proposal for a public-private camera program represents an innovative approach to enhancing public safety in Oakland. By leveraging advanced technology and fostering collaboration between the city, its residents, and the private sector, this initiative expects to not only improve crime prevention efforts but also strengthen the bonds within the community.

Oakland Municipal Code section 2.04.051.B permits the Council to waive advertising and the request for proposal/qualifications (RFP/Q) requirements upon a finding that it is in the best interest of the City to do so. In this case, the City lacks the equipment and qualified personnel to provide and install the necessary security camera network in East Oakland. The proposed professional services agreement with the proposed vendor is in the public interest because of AVS/SafeCity Connect's existing public private partnerships in the City, as further described below. Staff recommends that it is in the best interest of the City to waive the RFP/Q process due to the proposed vendor's existing security camera network in the City. The services to be provided under the proposed professional services agreement are of a professional, scientific, or technical and temporary nature and shall not result in the loss of employment or salary by any person having permanent status in the competitive service.

The Local Business Enterprise/Small Local Business Enterprise (LBE/SLBE) Program, Ordinance No. 13647 C.M.S., requires a minimum 50 percent (50%) participation for all professional service contracts valued at or over Fifty Thousand Dollars (\$50,00) when there are at least three certified businesses listed in the industry, trade, or profession that constitutes a major category of work; and if at least three L/SLBEs are not certified, then the requirement is either waived, or the 50% requirement may be set at a percent from 50% to 0%, but not less than 20% if at least one LBE/SLBE is certified and available. The Council may waive the City's LBE/SLBE program requirements pursuant to Part I of the Program guidelines, adopted by Ordinance No. 13647 C.M.S. Staff recommends that City Council waive the LBE/SLBE program requirements due to the proposed vendor's current efforts to obtain LBE/SLBE certification.

Budget Estimate

The \$150,000 appropriation is proposed to be used as shown in **Table 2**.

Table 2: Proposed Use of Appropriation

Budget Item	Cost	Detail
Professional Services	\$12,000	<p>Develop recommendations to EWD staff and business partners as selected by EWD on up to 6 strategic locations for new security camera installation.</p> <p>Review crime data and existing camera network (such as FLOCK cameras) along the Hegenberger Commercial Corridor in City Council District 7.</p> <p>Coordinate with the Oakland Police Department (OPD) on camera footage access for the installed cameras.</p>
Systems Integration	\$100,000	<p>Provide and install 30 cameras in the identified locations. Facilitate connection to online/Cloud-based service for the installed cameras.</p> <p>Provide one in-person training to business/property owners whose premises will host the installed cameras on how to use the cameras, including viewing video footage.</p>
Managed Services	\$38,000	<p>SafeCity Connect, System Health Monitoring, Help Desk Support, Authorized Participating User and OPD Officer training, Camera Registry (2 Year Term Included).</p>

ANALYSIS AND POLICY ALTERNATIVES

City Ownership and Installation of Security Cameras

Rather than work through an Intermediary, the City could purchase, own, install, and maintain the cameras on private property. This approach would require the City to execute multiple agreements with individual small businesses, many of whom were contacted and were unable or unwilling to meet the City’s contracting requirements, which creates a barrier to accessing the Program which may exacerbate rather than improve existing disparities. In addition, City control and monitoring of security camera footage would require significant City resources beyond the funds allocated for this program and City control and collection of data would raise additional privacy concerns requiring extensive mitigation measures.

Safe City Network and Applied Video Services

The City of Oakland currently has a networked camera program, called the Safe City Network in Downtown Oakland through a public private partnership between the Uptown/Downtown Business Improvement District (BID) and technology provider AVS. AVS has established a Safe City Network in San Francisco, providing forensic-grade video monitoring systems to provide a protective canopy of commercial areas that help police investigate crimes.

The technology is far more than cameras. It includes networks and servers that meet the highest reliability standards, and video analytic software that quickly retrieves evidence clips, while respecting the privacy of non-suspects. The cameras are an added tool to the City’s investment in FLOCK Automated License Plate Recognition (ALPR) systems, which function to automatically capture an image of a vehicle and the vehicle’s license plate, transform the plate image into alphanumeric characters using optical character recognition, compare the plate

number acquired to one or more databases (also known as “hot lists”) of vehicles of interest to law enforcement, and then alert law enforcement officers when a vehicle of interest has been observed.

With respect to privacy safeguards, AVS employs policies and workflows that protect citizen rights while preserving the court-admissibility of video evidence as part of a responsible video surveillance program.

The community typically owns the cameras and network, but the technology provider is ideally responsible for network maintenance and ensuring uptime. The provider supports training and shares field-proven policies to safeguard privacy rights appropriately to deliver forensic-grade video from the camera network that is admissible in court. The technology can easily scale up from one business or street to a community or an entire city, as needed.

Community Policing Programs

Businesses can actively participate in community policing initiatives by fostering open communication and collaboration with local law enforcement agencies. In addition to using technology such as security cameras and license plate readers, establishing neighborhood watch programs, attending community meetings, and organizing joint events with police to build trust and rapport within the community are effective and holistic approaches to creating safe, thriving neighborhoods and commercial districts.

- **Crime Prevention Measures:** Businesses can implement crime prevention measures such as installing surveillance cameras, adequate lighting, and security systems. By working closely with law enforcement, businesses can ensure that these measures are aligned with local crime trends and enforcement strategies.
- **Information Sharing:** Establishing channels for businesses to share information with law enforcement regarding suspicious activities, trends in criminal behavior, or security concerns can be invaluable in preventing and solving crimes. This could involve setting up tip lines, participating in information-sharing networks, or providing training to employees on recognizing and reporting suspicious behavior.
- **Training and Education:** Businesses can collaborate with law enforcement to provide training and educational programs for employees and the community on topics such as crime prevention, emergency response, and safety awareness. This can help empower individuals to take an active role in protecting themselves and their neighborhoods.
- **Supporting Law Enforcement Efforts:** Businesses can support law enforcement efforts through financial contributions, donations of equipment or resources, or by offering space for community events or police activities. By demonstrating a commitment to public safety, businesses can help strengthen the partnership between the community and law enforcement.

Overall, by working collaboratively with law enforcement, businesses can contribute to the creation of thriving neighborhoods where residents feel safe, secure, and empowered to actively participate in their community's well-being. Cameras are one of several tools to be implemented along the corridor.

FISCAL IMPACT

The \$150,000 in funding for this project may be available in General Purpose Fund (1010), Coliseum Redevelopment Organization (85242), Professional Services Account (54930), Cameras – Business Corridors Project (1006161), Coliseum Program (SC12). This funding is contingent on approval of carry forward use for FY23-24 and is not guaranteed due to possible carry forward retrenchment for the General Fund deficit.

PUBLIC OUTREACH / INTEREST

The EWD Business Development team has been working in coordination with Councilmember Reid and Councilmember Jenkins, Owners and Operators business association groups and area businesses advocating for additional crime prevention support including cameras and coordination with OPD. EWD staff shared this program outline and associated materials with the Privacy Advisory Commission (PAC) at the [May 5th, 2022 meeting](#) and received feedback at that time, and again at a subsequent meeting with the PAC ad-hoc committee on June 17, 2022.

COORDINATION

EWD reviewed OPD's list of License Plate Readers to coordinate placement of these cameras to complement the City's planned installation of the readers. In addition, EWD coordinated with OakDOT, the City Administrator Office's Neighborhood Enhanced Service Team (NEST), and Owners and Operators, a network of business and property owners that meet monthly with City leadership and service agencies to coordinate solutions to consistent and persistent challenges in the Hegenberger area and surrounds. The camera grants were part of the Owners and Operators Group's advocacy efforts as part of a holistic strategy to address public safety, service coordination, and to stabilize the commercial corridor following the closure of several prominent businesses in the area.

SUSTAINABLE OPPORTUNITIES

Economic: Business owners and operators reported significant economic losses due to theft, robbery, and property crime and continue to cite an urgent need for crime prevention and safety tools to stabilize business corridors. The Hegenberger Corridor and surrounding areas provide a critical revenue source in the form of sales tax revenue, necessitating a coordinated response to restore safety and to stabilize the local economy. Cameras along with other prevention tools and law enforcement are proven strategies to support and grow economic activity.

Race & Equity: The presence of quality security cameras demonstrates to majority Black and Latinx small business communities in East Oakland the City's commitment to safety and security and the City's investment in the community. This investment will enhance a culture of safety and security in the neighborhoods and along vital commercial corridors in East Oakland. There will be an immediate mitigating effect on illegal activity because security cameras will serve as a visual deterrent to potential criminal activity. Site selection and installation will be data-driven to ensure cameras are not deployed in a discriminatory, viewpoint-based, or biased manner, and in coordination with OPD data to identify areas with the highest number of service calls for criminal activity for deployment.

ACTION REQUESTED OF THE CITY COUNCIL

Staff Recommends That The City Council Adopt A Resolution Awarding A Professional Services Agreement With Applied Video Solutions, Inc. In An Amount Not To Exceed \$150,000 For A Two-year Period To Strengthen The Hegenberger Commercial Corridor And Surrounding Areas In East Oakland Through A Security Camera Network Program And Waiving The Competitive Advertising And Request For Proposals/Qualifications Requirements And The Local/Small Business Enterprise Program Requirements

For questions regarding this report, please contact Cristy Johnston Limon, Deputy Director, (510) 238-6193.

Respectfully submitted,



on behalf of

Ashleigh Kanat
Director, Economic and Workforce
Development

Prepared by:
Cristy Johnston Limon, Deputy Director
Economic and Workforce Development