



INTER OFFICE MEMORANDUM

TO: Alison Schwartz,
CIP Coordinator

FROM: Deborah Barnes, Director,
Contracts & Compliance

THROUGH: Shelley Darensburg, Senior
Contract Compliance Officer

PREPARED BY: Vivian Inman, Senior
Contract Compliance Officer

**SUBJECT: RFP for Estuary Park Renovation
And Expansion Project 2020**

DATE: March 3, 2020

At the request of the Public Works Department, the designated Compliance Officer conducted a compliance analysis of six (6) proposals submitted to the City in response to the above referenced RFP. Below are the results of the compliance evaluations for the minimum 50% Local and Small Local Business Enterprise (L/SLBE) participation requirement and the Equal Benefits Ordinance (EBO).

Responsive to Social Justice Policies	PROPOSED L/SLBE PARTICIPATION PERCENTAGES					EARNED PREFERENCE POINTS				EBO Compliant? Y/N
	Total L/SLBE	LBE	SLBE	*VSLBE	Total Credited	L/SLBE Participation	Years in Oakland	Oakland Workforce	Total Preference Points	
Fletcher Studio	65.00%	25.00%	40.00%	0.00%	65.00%	3 pts.	0 pts	0 pts.	0 pts	N
Hood Design	70.00%	25.00%	45.00%	0.00%	70.00%	4 pts.	2.5 pts.	0 pts.	0 pts	Y
Lowney Architecture	73.95%	42.25%	31.65%	.05% *1.00%	74.0%	4 pts	1.5 pts.	0 pts.	0 pts	Y
PGA Design	78.00%	24.00%	54.00%	0.00%	78.00%	4 pts.	2.5 pts.	0 pts.	0 pts	Y
WRT	69.00%	39.00%	25.00%	5% *10%	74.00%	4 pts	0 pts	0 pts	0 pts	N

Comments: All firms met or exceeded the minimum 50% L/SLBE program participation requirements. Terrain Studio and WRT are not EBO compliant. They must come into compliance prior to full contract execution.

Non-Responsive to Social Justice Policies	PROPOSED L/SLBE PARTICIPATION PERCENTAGES					EARNED PREFERENCE POINTS				EBO Compliant? Y/N
	Total L/SLBE	LBE	SLBE	*VSLBE	Total Credited	L/SLBE Participation	Years in Oakland	Oakland Workforce	Total Preference Points	
Terrain Studio	69.95%	55.90%	14.05%	1.00% 2.00%	0.00%	0 pts.	0 pts	0 pts	0 pts	N

Comments: Firm failed to meet the minimum 50% L/SLBE program participation requirements. Therefore, they are deemed non-responsive.

For questions or comments, please contact Vivian Inman at (510) 238-6261.



CONTRACTS AND COMPLIANCE

Compliance Division

PROJECT COMPLIANCE EVALUATION FOR :

RE: **RFP Estuary Park Renovation and Expansion Project 2020**

CONSULTANT/CONTRACTOR: Fletcher Studio

Engineer's Estimate:

NA

Contractors' Bid Amount

NA

Over/Under Engineer's Estimate

NA

Bid discounted amount:

N/A

Preference Points:

3 points

1. Did the 50% local/small local requirement apply: **YES**

2. Did the contractor meet the 50% requirement **YES**

a) % of LBE participation **25.00%**

b) % of SLBE participation **40.00%**

c) % of VSLBE participation ***0.00%**

3. Did the contractor receive bid discount/preference points? **YES**

(If yes, list the points received) **3 Points**

4. Additional Comments.

[Empty box for additional comments]

5. Date evaluation completed and returned to Contract Admin./Initiating Dept.

3/2/2020

Date

Reviewing Officer:

Vivian Kumar

Date: 3/2/2020

Approved By:

Shelley Darenburg

Date: 3/2/2020

LBE/SLBE Participation Fletcher Studio

Project Name: RFP Estuary Park Renovation and Expansion Project 2020

Project No.:		NA		Under/Over Engineers Estima							
Discipline	Prime & Subs	Location	Cert. Status	LBE	SLBE	VSLBE	Total LBE/SLBE %	Total Percentages	For Tracking Only		
									Ethn	MBE	WBE
PRIME	Fletcher Studio	San Francisco	UB					25.00%	C		
Architecture, Structural Engineering	Ware Associates	Oakland	CB		10.00%		10.00%	10.00%	C		
Hydrology, Ecology, Biology, permitting, CEQA/NEPA	Horizon Water & Environment	Oakland	CB		15.00%		15.00%	15.00%	O		
Hazardous Materials	Baseline Environmental Consultants	Emeryville	UB					5.00%	O		
Geotechnical	Rockridge Geotechnical	Oakland	CB		5.00%		5.00%	5.00%	C		
Civil Engineering, Surveying	BKF Engineers	Oakland	CB	25.00%			25.00%	25.00%	O		
Mechanical & Plumbing Engineering	YEI Engineers	Oakland	CB		5.00%		5.00%	5.00%	O		
Electrical Engineering	Zeiger Engineers	Oakland	CB		5.00%		5.00%	5.00%	C		
Traffic Engineering	CHS Coinsulting	San Francisco	UB					5.00%	AP	5.00%	
				Project Totals	25.00%	40.00%	65.00%	100.00%		5.00%	0.00%
Requirements:				The 50% requirement can be satisfied by a combination of 25% LBE and 25% SLBE. The SLBE requirement is waived for Oakland certified prime consultants. An VSLBE's participation is double counted toward meeting the requirement.							
Legend				LBE = Local Business Enterprise SLBE = Small Local Business Enterprise Total LBE/SLBE = All Certified Local and Small Local Businesses NPLBE = NonProfit Local Business Enterprise NPSLBE = NonProfit Small Local Business Enterprise UB = Uncertified Business CB = Certified Business MBE = Minority Business Enterprise WBE = Women Business Enterprise							
Ethnicity				AA = African American A = Asian C = Caucasian H = Hispanic NA = Native American O = Other NL = Not Listed							



CONTRACTS AND COMPLIANCE

Compliance Division

PROJECT COMPLIANCE EVALUATION FOR :

RE: RFP Estuary Park Renovation and Expansion Project 2020

CONSULTANT/CONTRACTOR: Hood Design Studio

<u>Engineer's Estimate:</u> NA	<u>Contractors' Bid Amount</u> NA	<u>Over/Under Engineer's Estimate</u> NA
<u>Bid discounted amount:</u> N/A	<u>Preference Points:</u> 4 points	

- 1. Did the 50% local/small local requirement apply: YES
- 2. Did the contractor meet the 50% requirement YES
 - a) % of LBE participation 25.00%
 - b) % of SLBE participation 45.00%
 - c) % of VSLBE participation 0.00%
- 3. Did the contractor receive bid discount/preference points? YES
(If yes, list the points received) 4 points
- 4. Additional Comments.

5. Date evaluation completed and returned to Contract Admin./Initiating Dept.

3/2/2020
Date

Reviewing Officer: *Maria Juma*

Date: 3/2/2020

Approved By: *Shelley Sorensburg*

Date: 3/2/2020

LBE/SLBE Participation Hood Design Studio

Project Name: RFP Estuary Park Renovation and Expansion Project 2020

Project No.:	NA	Engineer's Estimate				Under/Over Engineers Estimate:										
		Prime & Subs	Location	Cert. Status	LBE	SLBE	VSLBE	Total LBE/SLBE %	Total Percentages	Ethn	MBE	WBE				
PRIME	Hood Design Studio	Oakland	CB	40.00%			40.00%	40.00%	40.00%	AA	40.00%					
Engineering	Arup North America	Oakland San Francisco	CB	25.00%			25.00%	25.00%	25.00%	O						
Civil Engineering	Sherwood Design Engineers	San Francisco	UB				15.00%	15.00%	15.00%	NL						
Preserv. Lands. Arch	Place	Portland San Francisco	UB				5.00%	5.00%	5.00%	NL						
Cost Estimation	Directional Logic	San Francisco	UB				5.00%	5.00%	5.00%	C		5.00%				
Surveying	PLS Surveys, Inc.	Oakland	CB	3.00%			3.00%	3.00%	3.00%	C		3.00%				
Geotech Engineering Environmental Planner	Rockridge Geotech Sol Ecology	Oakland Petaluma	CB UB	2.00%			2.00%	2.00%	2.00%	C		5.00%				
Project Totals																
											45.00%	70.00%	100.00%			
										LBE 25% OR 50%	SLBE 25%	VSLBE	TOTAL LBE/SLBE 50%	TOTAL		

Requirements:
The 50% requirement can be satisfied by a combination of 25% LBE and 25% SLBE. The SLBE requirement is waived for Oakland certified prime consultants. An VSLBE's participation is double counted toward meeting the requirement.

Legend
 LBE = Local Business Enterprise
 SLBE = Small Local Business Enterprise
 Total LBE/SLBE = All Certified Local and Small Local Businesses
 NPLBE = NonProfit Local Business Enterprise
 NPSLBE = NonProfit Small Local Business Enterprise

UB = Uncertified Business
 CB = Certified Business
 MBE = Minority Business Enterprise
 WBE = Women Business Enterprise

Ethnicity
 AA = African American
 A = Asian
 C = Caucasian
 H = Hispanic
 NA = Native American
 O = Other
 NL = Not Listed

CONTRACTS AND COMPLIANCE

Compliance Division



PROJECT COMPLIANCE EVALUATION FOR :

RE: RFP Estuary Park Renovation and Expansion Project 2020

CONSULTANT/CONTRACTOR: Lowney Architecture

<u>Engineer's Estimate:</u>	<u>Contractors' Bid Amount</u>	<u>Over/Under Engineer's Estimate</u>
NA	NA	NA
<u>Bid discounted amount:</u>	<u>Preference Points:</u>	
N/A	4 points	

1. Did the 50% local/small local requirement apply: **YES**
2. Did the contractor meet the 50% requirement **YES**
 - a) % of LBE participation **42.25%**
 - b) % of SLBE participation **31.65%**
 - c) % of VSLBE participation **0.05%** (Double counted value is 1%)
3. Did the contractor receive bid discount/preference points? **YES**

(If yes, list the points received) **4 points**

4. Additional Comments.

***Proposed VSLBE/SPG participation is valued at 0.05%, however per the L/SLBE Program aVSLBE/LPG's participation is double counted towards meeting the requirement. Therefore, the value is 0.10%.**

5. Date evaluation completed and returned to Contract Admin./Initiating Dept.

3/2/2020

Date

Reviewing Officer:

Walter James

Date: 3/2/2020

Approved By:

Shelley Darenburg

Date: 3/2/2020

LBE/SLBE Participation Lowney Architecture

Project Name: RFP Estuary Park Renovation and Expansion Project 2020

Project No.:	NA		Engineer's Estimate			Under/Over Engineers Estimate:			For Tracking Only			
	Discipline	Prime & Subs	Location	Cert. Status	LBE	SLBE	VSLBE	Total LBE/SLBE %	Total Percentages	Ethn	MBE	WBE
Prime	Lowney Architecture		Oakland	CB		30.90%		30.90%	30.90%	C		
Engineering	ARUP		Oakland	CB	42.25%			42.25%	42.25%	C		
Environmental Consulting	Rincon Consultants, Inc.		Oakland	UB				9.50%	9.50%	C		
Landscape Architecture	Meyer Studio Land Architects		Berkeley	UB				9.00%	9.00%	C		
Irrigation Consultant	Brookwater Irrigation		Pleasanton	UB				2.50%	2.50%	C		2.50%
Bay Friendly Rater	Keller Mitchell		Oakland	UB				0.05%	0.05%	C		0.05%
Surveyor	PLS Survey		Oakland	CB		0.75%		0.75%	0.75%	C		
Cost Estimating	Directional Logic		Oakland San Francisco	UB				3.00%	3.00%	AP		3.00%
Art Consultant	Chandra Cerrito		Napa	UB				2.00%	2.00%	C		2.00%
Outreach and Engagement	RBA Creative		Oakland	CB			0.05%	0.05%	0.05%	AA	0.05%	
Project Totals						42.25%	31.65%	0.05%	73.95%	100.00%	0.05%	7.55%
Requirements: The 50% requirement can be satisfied by a combination of 25% LBE and 25% SLBE. The SLBE requirement is waived for Oakland certified prime consultants. An VSLBE's participation is double counted toward meeting the requirement.											Ethnicity AA = African American A = Asian C = Caucasian H = Hispanic NA = Native American O = Other NL = Not Listed	
Legend LBE = Local Business Enterprise SLBE = Small Local Business Enterprise Total LBE/SLBE = All Certified Local and Small Local Businesses NPLBE = NonProfit Local Business Enterprise NPSLBE = NonProfit Small Local Business Enterprise											UB = Uncertified Business CB = Certified Business MBE = Minority Business Enterprise WBE = Women Business Enterprise	

* Proposed VSLBE/LPG participation is valued at 0.05%, however per the L/SLBE Program a VSLBE/LPG's participation is double counted towards meeting the requirement. Double counted percentage is reflected on the evaluation form and cover memo.



CONTRACTS AND COMPLIANCE

Compliance Division

PROJECT COMPLIANCE EVALUATION FOR :

RE:

RFP Estuary Park Renovation and Expansion Project 2020

CONSULTANT/CONTRACTOR: PGA Design

Engineer's Estimate:
NA

Contractors' Bid Amount
NA

Over/Under Engineer's Estimate
NA

Bid discounted amount:
N/A

Preference Points:
4 points

1. Did the 50% local/small local requirement apply: **YES**

2. Did the contractor meet the 50% requirement **YES**

a) % of LBE participation **24.00%**

b) % of SLBE participation **54.00%**

c) % of VSLBE participation **0.00%**

3. Did the contractor receive bid discount/preference points? **NO**

(If yes, list the points received) **4 points**

4. Additional Comments.

[Empty box for additional comments]

5. Date evaluation completed and returned to Contract Admin./Initiating Dept.

3/2/2020
Date

Reviewing Officer:

Vivian...

Date: 3/2/2020

Approved By:

Shelley Darenburg

Date: 3/2/2020

LBE/SLBE Participation PGA Design

Project Name: RFP Estuary Park Renovation and Expansion Project 2020

Project No.:		NA		Engineer's Estimate				Under/Over Engineers Estimate:				
Discipline	Prime & Subs	Location	Cert. Status	LBE	SLBE	VSLBE	Total LBE/SLBE %	Total Percentages	Ethn	MBE	WBE	For Tracking Only
Prime Environmental Consultant Architect & Community	PGA Design	Oakland	CB		50.00%		50.00%	50.00%	C		50.00%	
	WRA Environmental Consultants	Emeryville	UB				10.00%	10.00%	C			
Civil Engineer	Noll & Tam	Berkeley	UB				10.00%	10.00%	C		10.00%	
	BKF Engineers	Oakland	CB	10.00%			10.00%	10.00%	C			
Hydrological Engineer	Geosyntec Consultants	Oakland	CB	10.00%			10.00%	10.00%	C			
	KPW	Oakland	CB	4.00%			4.00%	4.00%	C			
Structural Engineer	Zeiger Engineers	Oakland	CB		2.00%		2.00%	2.00%	C			
	BSK Associates	Livermore	UB				2.00%	2.00%	C			
Cost Estimator	Hattin Construction Management	Oakland	CB		2.00%		2.00%	2.00%	C			
Project Totals				24.00%	54.00%	0.00%	78.00%	100.00%		0.00%	60.00%	
<p>Requirements: The 50% requirement can be satisfied by a combination of 25% LBE and 25% SLBE. The SLBE requirement is waived for Oakland certified prime consultants. An VSLBE's participation is double counted toward meeting the requirement.</p>												
<p>Legend</p> <div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between;"> <div style="width: 45%;"> <p>LBE = Local Business Enterprise SLBE = Small Local Business Enterprise Total LBE/SLBE = All Certified Local and Small Local Businesses NPLBE = NonProfit Local Business Enterprise NPSLBE = NonProfit Small Local Business Enterprise</p> </div> <div style="width: 45%;"> <p>UB = Uncertified Business CB = Certified Business MBE = Minority Business Enterprise WBE = Women Business Enterprise</p> </div> </div>												
<p>Ethnicity AA = African American A = Asian C = Caucasian H = Hispanic NA = Native American O = Other NL = Not Listed</p>												

CONTRACTS AND COMPLIANCE

Compliance Division



PROJECT COMPLIANCE EVALUATION FOR :

RE:

RFP Estuary Park Renovation and Expansion Project 2020

CONSULTANT/CONTRACTOR: WRT

Engineer's Estimate:

NA

Contractors' Bid Amount

NA

Over/Under Engineer's Estimate

NA

Bid discounted amount:

N/A

Preference Points:

4 points

1. Did the 50% local/small local requirement apply: **YES**
2. Did the contractor meet the 50% requirement **YES**
- a) % of LBE participation **39.00%**
 - b) % of SLBE participation **25.00%**
 - c) % of VSLBE participation **5.00%** (Double counted value is 10%)
3. Did the contractor receive bid discount/preference points? **YES**
- (If yes, list the points received) **4 points**

4. Additional Comments.

[Empty box for additional comments]

5. Date evaluation completed and returned to Contract Admin./Initiating Dept.

3/2/2020

Date

Reviewing Officer:

Vivian James

Date: 3/2/2020

Approved By:

Shelley Darenburg

Date: 3/2/2020

LBE/SLBE Participation WRT

Project Name: RFP Estuary Park Renovation and Expansion Project 2020		Engineer's Estimate		Under/Over Engineers Estimate:							
Project No.:	NA	Location	Cert. Status	LBE	SLBE	VSLBE	Total LBE/SLBE %	Total Percentages	For Tracking Only		
Discipline	Prime & Subs								Ethn	WBE	
Prime Ecological Design	WRT	San Francisco	UB				20.00%	28.00%	C		
Architecture	ESA	Oakland	CB	20.00%			16.00%	20.00%	C	20.00%	
Environmental/Geotechnical	Murakami/Nelson	Oakland	CB		16.00%			16.00%	AP	16.00%	
Civil Engineers	Terraphase	Oakland	CB	5.00%			5.00%	5.00%	C		
Structural Engineering	BKF	Oakland	CB	12.00%			12.00%	12.00%	C		
Electrical Engineer	KPW	Oakland	CB	2.00%			2.00%	2.00%	C		
Engagement	Zeiger Engineering	Oakland	CB		5.00%		5.00%	5.00%	C		
Irrigation Support	RBA Creative	Oakland	CB			3.00%	3.00%	3.00%	AA	3.00%	
Mechanical Engineering	RMA	Walnut Creek	UB				1.00%	1.00%	C		
Cultural Resources	Native Soil	Oakland	CB				1.00%	1.00%	H	1.00%	
Marine Engineering	H&M Mechanical Preservation Architecture	Oakland	CB		4.00%		4.00%	4.00%	C		
	COWI	Oakland	UB				1.00%	2.00%	C		
Project Totals				39.00%	25.00%	5.00%	69.00%	100.00%		20.00%	20.00%
Requirements:				Ethnicity							
The 50% requirement can be satisfied by a combination of 25% LBE and 25% SLBE. The SLBE requirement is waived for Oakland certified prime consultants. An VSLBE's participation is double counted toward meeting the requirement.				AA = African American A = Asian C = Caucasian H = Hispanic NA = Native American O = Other NL = Not Listed							
Legend				UB = Uncertified Business CB = Certified Business MBE = Minority Business Enterprise WBE = Women Business Enterprise LBE = Local Business Enterprise SLBE = Small Local Business Enterprise Total LBE/SLBE = All Certified Local and Small Local Businesses NPLBE = NonProfit Local Business Enterprise NPSLBE = NonProfit Small Local Business Enterprise							

* Proposed VSLBE/LPG participation is valued at 5%, however per the LJSLBE Program a VSLBE/LPG's participation is double counted towards meeting the requirement. Double counted percentage is reflected on the evaluation form and cover memo.

CONTRACTS AND COMPLIANCE

Compliance Division



PROJECT COMPLIANCE EVALUATION FOR :

RE:

RFP Estuary Park Renovation and Expansion Project 2020

CONSULTANT/CONTRACTOR: Terrain Studio

<u>Engineer's Estimate:</u> NA	<u>Contractors' Bid Amount</u> NA	<u>Over/Under Engineer's Estimate</u> NA
<u>Bid discounted amount:</u> N/A	<u>Preference Points:</u> 3 points	

1. Did the 50% local/small local requirement apply: **YES**
2. Did the contractor meet the 50% requirement **YES**
- | | | |
|-----------------------------|---------------|------------------------------|
| a) % of LBE participation | 55.90% | |
| b) % of SLBE participation | 14.05% | |
| c) % of VSLBE participation | 1.00% | (Double counted value is 2%) |
3. Did the contractor receive bid discount/preference points? **YES**
- (If yes, list the points received) **3 points**

4. Additional Comments.

Firm failed to meet the 50% L/SLBE Program requirement with an SLBE shortfall of 8.95. Therefore, the firm is deemed non-compliant.

5. Date evaluation completed and returned to Contract Admin./Initiating Dept.

3/2/2020
Date

Reviewing Officer:

Maria Pina

Date: 3/2/2020

Approved By:

Shelley Darsenburg

Date: 3/2/2020

LBE/SLBE Participation Terrain Studio

Project Name: RFP Estuary Park Renovation and Expansion Project 2020

Project No.:	NA		Engineer's Estimate				Under/Over Engineers Estimate:			For Tracking Only		
	Discipline	Prime & Subs	Location	Cert. Status	LBE	SLBE	VSLBE	Total LBE/SLBE %	Total Percentages	Ethn	MBE	WBE
	Prime Landscape Architects	Terrain Studio	Oakland	CB	50.90%			50.90%	50.90%	AP		50.90%
	Community Engagement	TS Studio	San Francisco	UB				20.00%	20.00%	C		20.00%
	Architect & Structural Engineering	RBA Creative	Oakland	CB			1.00%	1.00%	1.00%	C		1.00%
	Ecological Engineering	Ware Associates	Oakland	CB		7.00%		7.00%	7.00%	C		
	Lighting Designer	Sherwood Design Engineers	San Francisco	UB				2.00%	5.00%	C		
	Civil Engineering	LumenWorks	Oakland	CB		2.00%		2.00%	2.00%	C		
	Surveying and Remediation	Calichi Design Group	Oakland	CB	5.00%			5.00%	5.00%	C		
	Electrical & Plumbing	Sousa Land Surveys	Dixon	UB				2.00%	2.00%	C		
	Archeological	Rockridge Geotechnical	Oakland	CB		3.00%		3.00%	3.00%	C		
	an dHistoric	Yei Engineers	Oakland	CB		2.00%		2.00%	2.00%	AP	2.00%	
	Bay Friendly Rating	ARCHEO-TEC Consulting	Okaland	UB				0.05%	0.05%	NL		
	Estimation and Delivery	Keller Mitchell and Company	Oakland	CB		0.05%		0.05%	0.05%	C		0.05%
	Water Conversation	Mack5	Emeryville	UB				1.00%	1.00%	AP	1.00%	
		Brookwater Irrigation Consultants	Pleasanton	UB				1.00%	1.00%	C		1.00%

LBE/SLBE Participation Terrain Studio

Project Name: RFP Estuary Park Renovation and Expansion Project 2020

Project No.:	NA	Engineer's Estimate				Under/Over Engineers Estimate:						
		Prime & Subs	Location	Cert. Status	LBE	SLBE	VSLBE	Total LBE/SLBE %	Total Percentages	For Tracking Only		
Discipline										Ethn	MBE	WBE
Project Totals												
					55.90%	14.05%	1.00%	69.95%	100.00%		3.00%	72.95%
<p>Requirements: The 50% requirement can be satisfied by a combination of 25% LBE and 25% SLBE. The SLBE requirement is waived for Oakland certified prime consultants. An VSLBE's participation is double counted toward meeting the requirement.</p>												
<p>Legend</p> <div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between;"> <div style="width: 45%;"> <p>LBE = Local Business Enterprise SLBE = Small Local Business Enterprise Total LBE/SLBE = All Certified Local and Small Local Businesses NPLBE = NonProfit Local Business Enterprise NP/SLBE = NonProfit Small Local Business Enterprise</p> </div> <div style="width: 45%;"> <p>UB = Uncertified Business CB = Certified Business MBE = Minority Business Enterprise WBE = Women Business Enterprise</p> </div> </div>												
<p>Ethnicity AA = African American A = Asian C = Caucasian H = Hispanic NA = Native American O = Other NL = Not Listed</p>												