



2006 DEC 19 AM 9:19

CITY HALL • ONE FRANK H. OGAWA PLAZA • OAKLAND, CALIFORNIA 94612

JANE BRUNNER
Councilmember
District 1

(510) 238-7001
FAX (510) 238-6910
TTD (510) 238-7413

To: Chair Nadel and Members of the Public Works Committee
From: Councilmember Jane Brunner
Date: December 12, 2006
Re: Utility Boxes, Item 4

Thank you again for your taking on this very complicated issue. As part of my work on this issue, I have reviewed San Francisco's regulations for the placement of utility boxes. I believe that the Design Review Guidelines contained in the staff report are a beginning and would like to recommend a number of regulations San Francisco uses for adoption. Among them:

1. The regulations outline a number of requirements an applicant must meet before the City will consider placing a box at a location. I believe we should adopt the following:
 - Require an applicant to submit a 5-year plan for all boxes to be installed
 - Require an applicant to submit plans of all sizes and shapes of boxes that are available to them to install
 - Require an applicant to survey the area for at least 3 private property locations to site the box, and show proof of an attempt to place the box at one of the locations
 - Require an applicant to attempt to underground the box where it is technologically and economically feasible. The burden of proof to show infeasibility is on the applicant, and the applicant must demonstrate an attempt to underground the box
 - Require an applicant to show efforts to collocate the box with existing boxes
2. Attachment B to San Francisco's regulations, which I have attached, is a detailed list of placement and design guidelines. I would recommend the adoption of all of them.
3. I would also recommend that we adopt San Francisco's notification process. After a site visit by staff, there is a 20 day public notice period for comment on the application to all within 300 feet. Any protests are heard by a Hearing Officer. There is also a 30 day public notice of construction.
4. I also recommend that City staff bring to December 19th further detail on the Design Review process and examples of what boxes would look like with the new design guidelines and masking requirements.

22
COUNCIL

DEC 19 2006

EXHIBIT B

SURFACE-MOUNTED FACILITY PLACEMENT GUIDELINES

The following are guidelines for the Department to use during a site visit to determine acceptable locations for Surface-Mounted Facilities in the Public Rights-of-Way. The Department is not required to apply any guideline that the Department determines is not applicable to a particular installation of a Surface-Mounted Facility.

1. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall be no larger than is reasonably necessary to contain and protect the required equipment.
2. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall not obstruct pedestrians. A minimum of four feet (4') of pedestrian clearance (free of all obstacles for a clear path of travel, unobstructed pedestrian walkway) shall be maintained at all times.
3. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall not intrude on pedestrian "clear zones" at street corners.
4. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall be set back a minimum of five feet (5') from edge of crosswalk areas.
5. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall be set back a minimum of eighteen inches (18") from the face of the curb.
6. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall be set back a minimum of eight feet (8') from any fire escape and/or fire exit.
7. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall be set back a minimum of five feet (5') from any fire hydrant, driveway, curb ramp, or blue zone parking space.
8. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall be set back a minimum of forty inches (40") from any other above-ground structure not otherwise specified herein including, but not limited to, street light poles, parking meters, trees, etc.
9. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall be set back a minimum of sixty feet (60') from any Municipal Railway transit shelter and/or kiosk, unless the location of the Surface-Mounted Facility is coordinated with the transit shelter and/or kiosk.
10. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall be set back a minimum of five feet (5') from any certified street artist's designated area per list to be provided by the Department (which list is complete only as of the date of this order and will be updated when any new street artist's designated areas are established).
11. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall be set back a minimum of sixty feet (60') from any public art work under the jurisdiction of the Arts Commission of San Francisco, except for public art on kiosks, per the San Francisco Civic Art Collection published by the Arts Commission of San Francisco (which book is complete only as of the date of this order and will be updated when any new public art works are established).
12. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall not be placed over any storm drain or other utility facility.
13. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall not obstruct the view of any traffic sign, wayfinding sign, traffic signal or any other existing facility.
14. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall not be placed on the property of, or adjacent to a designated local, State or National Historic Landmark. For the purposes of applying the limitations and conditions specified in this paragraph, in relation to any specific location, the word adjacent shall mean on the same side of the street and in front of the subject building or in front of the next building on either side.
15. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall not be placed in Local Historic Districts listed in Appendices B-L of Article 10 of the San Francisco Planning Code.

16. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall not be placed in Conservation Districts designated in Appendices E-J of Article 11 of the San Francisco Planning Code.
17. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall not be placed in California Register Historic Districts, National Historic Districts, and National Register Historic Districts.
18. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall not front the boundaries of a park, recreation area, or open space.
19. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall be either stainless steel or painted to match the color used for City structures in the vicinity (e.g., JCDecaux green, Embarcadero blue) unless otherwise specified by the Department and shall have graffiti-proof coating.
20. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall be screened by landscaping where appropriate for the neighborhood and required by the Department.
21. Surface-Mounted Facilities shall not unreasonably affect the aesthetic character of neighborhoods or the natural character of regional open spaces in accordance with the City and County of San Francisco General Plan.
22. Surface-Mounted Facilities may be placed in local, State or National Historic Landmarks as discussed in No. 14 above, Local Historic Districts as discussed in No. 15 above, Conservation Districts as discussed in No. 16 above, and California Register Historic Districts, National Historic Districts, National Register Historic Districts as discussed in No. 17 above, and parks, recreation areas, and open spaces as discussed in No. 18 above, if they are to be collocated with existing transit shelters, kiosks, or other street furniture, provided that the size and footprint of the existing facility is not unreasonably increased by the addition of the Surface Mounted Facility.

22

CRAIG QUINN

2006 DEC 14 AM 9:19

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND LEGALITY

INTRODUCED BY COUNCILMEMBERS:

Oakland City Attorney's Office

ORDINANCE NO. _____ C.M.S.

DRAFT

AN URGENCY ORDINANCE, PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 65858, ESTABLISHING A TEMPORARY MORATORIUM ON THE CONSTRUCTION, MODIFICATION, PLACEMENT OR APPROVAL OF APPLICATIONS FOR ISSUANCE OF PERMITS FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF ABOVE-GROUND UTILITY OR EQUIPMENT CABINETS WITHIN THE PUBLIC RIGHT OF WAY

WHEREAS, Government Code § 65858 allows a city, including a charter city, without following the procedures otherwise required prior to the adoption of a zoning ordinance, to adopt, as an urgency measure, an interim ordinance prohibiting any uses which may be in conflict with a contemplated general plan, specific plan, or zoning proposal which the legislative body, planning commission, or planning department is intending to study within a reasonable time; and

WHEREAS, the City of Oakland's Community Economic Development Agency is in the process of evaluating new amendments to the City's zoning regulations, or other controls, relating to design, location and size requirements for the construction, modification or placement of above-ground utility or equipment cabinets; and

WHEREAS, until such time that the City concludes its review and adopts and institutes new land use regulations governing design, location and size requirements for the construction, modification or placement of above-ground utility or equipment cabinets, the community is in jeopardy that above-ground utility or equipment cabinets could be constructed, modified or placed prior to the imposition of new regulations necessary for the protection of public health, safety and welfare;

WHEREAS, the City Council finds and determines that the ~~construction, modification, placement, or approval of pending or new applications~~ issuance of permits for above-ground utility or equipment cabinets during the moratorium period, in which possible amendments to the Zoning Regulations, or other controls, are being studied, could result in conflicts with any proposed amendments/controls and would undermine the purpose of studying such amendments/controls, thereby reducing the quality of life within the community to the extent the overall public health, safety and welfare are detrimentally affected; and

WHEREAS, the City's current utility or equipment cabinet regulations are administrative guidelines that are deficient in several areas, including but not limited to: they do not adequately address community concerns regarding locational standards and design,

22

handicapped access, and they allow permit applications to be handled through an administrative review process that requires public notification through notice by the utility company but does not include a public review process with direct involvement of the City; and

WHEREAS, since 2002, the City of Oakland has received an increasing number of applications for the construction, modification, and/or placement of above-ground utility or equipment cabinets throughout the City, in response to changing technology and the physical requirements required to connect this new technology to residential neighborhoods; and

WHEREAS, currently, the City of Oakland Community and Economic Development Agency approves, on average, three permits per week for the installation, construction, placement, and/or modification of utility or equipment cabinets, and there are currently pending applications on file; and

WHEREAS, changes in broadband, energy, transportation and telecommunications technology, as well as projected increases in residential and commercial development throughout the City, coupled with the desire of utility providers to increase their services in the City and surrounding areas are all projected to result in additional permit applications for the placement or modification of utility or equipment cabinets within the City of Oakland; and

WHEREAS, significant concerns have been raised in the community regarding the continuing adequacy of the current procedures and guidelines to address the increased number of permit applications and new technologies, and to ensure informed, consistent, uniform, and fair decisions on permit applications for new and/or modified utility or equipment cabinets throughout the City; and

WHEREAS, citizens of the City of Oakland have also expressed significant concerns regarding the impacts that a proliferation of above-ground utility or equipment cabinets within the City of Oakland may have upon the community as a whole, including, but not limited to, safe public access, noise, maintenance, adverse visual impacts, and incompatibility of such large installations in residential zones; and

WHEREAS, citizens of the City of Oakland have expressed a desire that the City receive adequate services provided that these larger facilities are designed and located to minimize the concerns described above; and

WHEREAS, it is the intent of the Oakland City Council to consider and adopt new zoning regulations, or other controls, pertaining to above-ground utility or equipment cabinets in order to provide clear, consistent, and uniform guidance to utility or equipment cabinet providers regarding the siting and design of above-ground utility or equipment cabinets while also addressing the significant community concerns described above, and to better reflect the City's siting and regulatory objectives for such facilities, all within the limitations specified in the; and

WHEREAS, the Oakland City Council has determined that a temporary moratorium on ~~the construction, modification, placement or approval of applications~~ the issuance of permits for above-ground utility or equipment cabinets will allow the City time to complete its review and

revisions of its design and procedural review regulations while ensuring to the maximum extent feasible that the siting and other objectives of the revised ordinance/regulations may be achieved; and

WHEREAS, for the reasons set forth above, this ordinance is declared by the Oakland City Council to be necessary for preserving the public peace, health, or safety and to avoid a current, immediate and direct threat to the health, safety, or welfare of the community, and the “Whereas” clauses above taken together constitute the City Council’s statement of the reasons constituting such necessity and urgency.

NOW, THEREFORE, THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF OAKLAND DOES ORDAIN AS FOLLOWS:

SECTION 1. The City Council finds and determines the foregoing recitals to be true and correct and hereby makes them a part of this ordinance.

SECTION 2. The City Council finds and determines, for the reasons stated in the recitals, the adoption of this ordinance is exempt from CEQA under Sections 15061(b)(3), 15307, 15308, and 15183 of the State CEQA Guidelines.

SECTION 3. The City Council hereby directs the Community and Economic Development Agency to immediately work on the preparation of amended zoning regulations, or other appropriate controls, governing the construction, modification, and placement of above-ground utility or equipment cabinets within the City of Oakland right of way and to submit them for consideration by the Planning Commission and City Council, as may be appropriate.

SECTION 4. Until such time as the City concludes the review described above, and adopts new Regulations or otherwise establishes new design and siting criteria or amends Chapter 12 and/or 17 of the Municipal Code, the City of Oakland hereby declares a moratorium on the ~~construction, modification, placement, or approval of permit applications~~ issuance of permits for above-ground utility or equipment cabinets as defined in section 5 below. Nothing herein is intended to, nor does, prevent the submittal of such applications by utility or equipment cabinet providers, however, such applications are submitted at the sole cost, expense and risk of the providers.

SECTION 5. For purposes of this Ordinance, the following definition shall apply:

“Utility or Equipment Cabinet” means any above-ground structure, cabinet, electric meter, and any other appurtenance installed for or servicing telecommunication or utility purposes above surrounding grade in the public rights-of-way, excluding facilities which are regulated separately pursuant to Chapter 17.128 of the Oakland Zoning Regulations. For the purposes of reviewing allowable Utility or Equipment Cabinet Applications, all structures, cabinets, electric meters, and any other appurtenance that share a common structural foundation shall be defined as one Utility or Equipment Cabinet. All structures, cabinets, electric meters, and any other appurtenance required to operate a facility, but that do not share a common structural foundation, shall be considered a separate Utility or Equipment Cabinet installation. The number of separate Utility

or Equipment Cabinet installations shall be based on the number of separate structural foundations installed when the facility is fully operational.

SECTION 6. In accordance with Government Code Section 65858, this Ordinance shall be in full force and effect for a period of 45 days from the date of its adoption, i.e., **from December 19, 2006 through and including February 28, 2007**, prohibiting the ~~construction, modification, placement, or approval of permits~~ issuance of permits for above-ground utility or equipment cabinets, except as provided in Sections 7, 8 and 9, below. This 45-day period may be extended by the City Council in accordance with the provisions of California Government Code Section 65858.

SECTION 7. Exceptions. Any proposed above-ground utility or equipment cabinets that are reasonably necessary for the protection of life and public safety (including traffic control devices) are exempt from the moratorium established under this urgency ordinance. The City Council shall determine, based on substantial evidence in the record, whether such utility or equipment cabinets meet these requirements. In addition, the moratorium shall not apply to the following activities, as defined in Section 17.128.020 of the current Zoning Regulations, and as determined by the Planning Director:

- a. Minor modifications of existing utility or equipment cabinets, whether emergency or routine, provided there is little or no change in the visual appearance and no increase in external dimensions. Minor modifications are those modifications, *including the addition of or modification of internal equipment or access doors.*

SECTION 8. During the term of this ordinance as set forth in Section 6 hereof, no building, encroachment, excavation, zoning or other permits that have been issued for the construction, modification, or placement of any above-ground utility or equipment cabinets but for which rights to proceed with the utility or equipment cabinets have not vested pursuant to the provisions of State law, shall proceed; and no building, encroachment, excavation, zoning or other permits for the construction, modification, or placement of any above-ground utility or equipment cabinets shall be issued by any department, agency, employee, or agent of the City of Oakland. Only utility or equipment cabinets which have vested rights, pursuant to the provisions of the State law, prior to the date of this Ordinance may proceed with construction, modification, or placement, unless expressly provided for herein .

SECTION 9. Petition for Relief from Moratorium. Any person who has applied to construct, modify or place a utility or equipment cabinet which would be affected by this Moratorium, and who contends that the Moratorium as applied to him or her would be unlawful under Federal, State, or local law or regulation, must submit a written Petition to the Planning Director requesting relief from the Moratorium. Failure to submit such a Petition will preclude such person from challenging the moratorium in court. The Petition shall identify the name and address of the applicant, the affected application number, and shall state specifically and completely how the Moratorium as applied to him or her would be unlawful under Federal, State, or local law or regulation. Failure to raise each and every issue that is contested in the Petition and provide appropriate supporting evidence will be grounds to deny the Petition and will also preclude the Petitioner from raising such issues in court. Within fifteen (15) working days of

receipt of the Petition, the City Administrator, or her designee, shall mail to the Petitioner a written determination accepting or rejecting the Petition. The City Administrator's decision shall be final and not subject to administrative appeal.

SECTION 10. The City Clerk shall certify to the passage and adoption of this Ordinance causing it to be posted, as required by the law, and it shall thereafter be in full force and effect. This Ordinance shall become effective immediately as an interim urgency ordinance, in order to protect the public health, safety, and welfare.

SECTION 11. For the term of this ordinance, as set forth in Section 6 hereof, the provisions of this ordinance shall govern, to the extent there is any conflict between the provisions of this ordinance and the provisions of any other City code, ordinance, resolution or policy, and all such conflicting provisions shall be suspended.

SECTION 12. This Ordinance is enacted pursuant to the City of Oakland's general police powers, Section 106 of the Charter of the City of Oakland, Article XI of the California Constitution and Government Code section 65858.

SECTION 13. If any section, subsection, sentence, clause or phrase of this Ordinance is for any reason held by a court of competent jurisdiction to be invalid, such decision shall not affect the validity of the remaining portions of this ordinance. The City Council declares that it would have adopted this Ordinance and each section, subsection, sentence, clause and phrase thereof, irrespective of the fact that any one or more section, subsection, sentence, clause, or phrase be declared invalid.

IN COUNCIL, OAKLAND, CALIFORNIA, _____, 2006

PASSED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES - BRUNNER, KERNIGHAN, NADEL, QUAN, BROOKS, REID, CHANG, and
PRESIDENT DE LA FUENTE

NOES -

ABSENT -

ABSTENTION -

ATTEST:

LATONDA SIMMONS
City Clerk and Clerk of the Council of
the City of Oakland, California

22
CITY COUNCIL