



FILED  
OFFICE OF THE CITY CLERK  
OAKLAND

2018 MAY 10 PM 2:11

# AGENDA REPORT

TO: Sabrina B. Landreth  
City Administrator

FROM: Anne E. Kirkpatrick  
Chief of Police

SUBJECT: Police Training, Policy, and  
Accountability

DATE: April 18, 2018

City Administrator Approval

Date:

5/9/18

## RECOMMENDATION

**Staff Recommends That The Public Safety Committee Receive This Informational Report With Information Regarding Internal Affairs Investigations, Police Personnel Trainings, Updates To Police Policy, And Recent Developments In Police Discipline.**

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report is responsive to a request from the Oakland Office of the City Attorney (OCA) concerning police training regarding discipline, policy, and accountability within the Oakland Police Department (OPD). The request was based on a recommendation from a report filed with the United States District Court, Northern District of California ("the Court"), concerning discipline in OPD. The report to the Court is a result of litigation initially involving the City of Oakland in the *Delphine Allen v. City of Oakland* matter and ultimately identifying a concern with the imposition of discipline in OPD. This report covers July 1, 2017 through September 30, 2017.

## BACKGROUND / LEGISLATIVE HISTORY

On April 16, 2015, the court-appointed attorney investigator, Ed Swanson, filed a report with the Court, resulting from a court-ordered investigation of discipline within OPD. This report ("First Swanson Report") included factual findings and recommendations regarding police discipline in Oakland. On March 21, 2016, the Second Report of the Court-Appointed Investigator in *Delphine Allen v. City of Oakland* ("Second Swanson Report") was filed with the Court.

The Second Swanson Report included 14 recommendations, primarily for OCA and OPD. Included was a recommendation that:

OCA should report to City Council quarterly on recent arbitration decisions, its efforts to support the police discipline process, and recent developments in police discipline. OPD should simultaneously provide a separate quarterly report to the City Council regarding IAD [Internal Affairs Division] investigations, police personnel trainings, updates to police policy, and recent developments in police

Item: \_\_\_\_\_  
Public Safety Committee  
May 22, 2018

discipline. Both OPD and OCA should simultaneously provide their reports to the Mayor and City Administrator.

This report is responsive to the OPD portion of the above recommendation.

## **ANALYSIS AND POLICY ALTERNATIVES**

### *Internal Affairs Division Investigations*

As a participant in the White House Police Data Initiative, OPD provides a number of metrics on its website on a regular basis. One of these is a quarterly report providing investigation information from the Internal Affairs Division (IAD). The most recent (Fourth Quarter 2017 Year-to-date) IAD Report is provided as **Attachment A**. This report provides several important pieces of information, including:

- The number of cases investigated
- The number of allegations investigated
- The type of discipline recommended
- Specific Manual of Rules violations and the number of allegations of each

### *Police Personnel Trainings*

During the fourth quarter of 2017, police personnel trainings included the following topics in the sergeant continuous professional training:

- Grievance Procedure/OPOA Update (two hours)
- IAD Update/PRIME (Performance Reporting Information Metrics Environment - one hour)

This training was provided to 73 sergeants. These sergeants are broken down below by race:

- African American: 11
- Asian: 15
- Hispanic: 14
- White: 33

### *Updates to Police Policy*

As provided in the previous quarterly report, OPD currently has a policy manual made of Departmental General Orders (DGOs). Also as previously reported, OPD entered an agreement with Lexipol as a voluntary sustainability measure to migrate all OPD policies to a more robust system. Lexipol is a company that provides a policy system that provides public agencies with model policies, online access to these policies, accountability and reporting mechanisms concerning these policies, and training based on the policies. As the final review and migration policies were being undertaken in late 2017 and early 2018, further analysis of

Lexipol revealed that the content being provided by Lexipol was unsuitable for OPD. OPD requires such significant modification of the policies provided by Lexipol that they were no longer useful. In addition, OPD requires a number of policies that have no Lexipol model policy equivalent. Instead of continuing the process of migrating existing OPD policies to the Lexipol format, OPD has revised the DGO format to provide better content more concisely. All 17 policies that were migrated to Lexipol will be reformatted as DGOs. Eventually, all DGOs will be rewritten. All Training Bulletins will be rewritten as DGO procedures that accompany the appropriate DGOs.

There were a number of significant policy achievements during the fourth quarter of 2017. The policy development process was improved to reduce delay and increase efficiency while maintaining quality of product. Individual policy achievements include substantial review and revision of the below policies, most of which are available on the OPD website.<sup>1</sup>

- General Order M-03 Complaints Against Departmental Personnel\*
- General Order M-04 Coordination of Criminal Investigations\*
- General Order M-04.1/Lexipol 611 Criminal Investigations Involving Active Law Enforcement, or a Member of the Department
- Training Bulletin V-T Departmental Discipline Policy\*
- Training Bulletin V-T.1 Internal Investigation Procedures

\* Indicates completion of this policy during fourth quarter 2017.

#### *Swanson Report Recommendations about Discipline*

To help with police discipline, the First Swanson Report<sup>2</sup> recommended the appointment of a Civilian Manager position in IAD. The Second Swanson Report<sup>3</sup> recommended that the IAD Civilian Manager develop institutional memory within IAD through the development of an IAD manual. An IAD Civilian Manager was hired in October of 2015.

#### *Recent Developments in Police Discipline Resulting from the Swanson Recommendations*

OPD developed a process to review recommendations concerning policy, training, and the discipline process from IAD, Skelly officers, supervisors, attorneys, and others. The process includes:

- The IAD Civilian Manager tracks the recommended policy and training changes and provides recommendations from IAD reports to the Research and Planning Manager (policy) and the Training Section Commander (training). The recommendations concerning the discipline process are addressed within IAD.
- The Force Review Board Coordinator continues to route deliverables concerning policy to the Research and Planning Manager and deliverables concerning training to the Training Section Commander.

<sup>1</sup> <http://www2.oaklandnet.com/Government/o/OPD/s/DepartmentalPublications/OAK034257>

<sup>2</sup> <https://www.cand.uscourts.gov/filelibrary/1585/Swanson%20report.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <https://www.cand.uscourts.gov/filelibrary/1726/2d-Swanson-report.pdf>

- Skelly officers notify the Research and Planning Manager of policy recommendations and the Training Section Commander of training recommendations.
- The Office of the City Attorney continues to notify the Research and Planning Manager of policy recommendations and the Training Section Commander of training recommendations resulting from arbitrations.

Regarding the Second Swanson Report recommendations for the OPD IAD manual, OPD has an IAD manual that the IAD Civilian Manager revised. A completed draft of the entire manual was promulgated in June 2017. It has been reviewed by the Independent Monitoring Team (IMT) and has been updated to include IMT recommendations. The policy manual has since been reviewed by OCA and is undergoing final formatting and editing by OPD.

As part of the police discipline process, OPD examines whether a supervisor ordered or otherwise caused the misconduct in question. OPD has further developed the Member/Employee Accountability Section of the Report of Investigation to include two subsections. The first addresses whether any member or employee observed misconduct or was otherwise aware of it. The second subsection addresses whether any supervisor ordered or caused the action which led to the violation. OPD developed a process for commanders to review prior discipline issues to determine if adequate supervision was provided for all current disciplinary cases.

*Number of Complaints Received 2011-Present*

At the November 15, 2016 Public Safety Committee meeting, staff was asked to provide the overall number of Internal Affairs cases for previous years and the overall number of Internal Affairs allegations for previous years. Table 1 provides an annual breakdown.

*Table 1: Total Number of Internal Affairs Cases and Allegations*

Year	Total Cases	Total Allegations
2011	1,446	3,067
2012	2,592	4,472
2013	1,533	2,403
2014	1,066	1,906
2015	1,011	2,115
2016	1,185	2,600
2017	1,264	3,138

*Failure to Supervise: Cases and Discipline Imposed 2011-Present*

At the November 15, 2016 Public Safety Committee meeting, staff was asked to provide the number of cases investigated for failure to supervise for the last five years as well as the number of times discipline was sustained for failure to supervise for the last five years. Table 2 provides an annual breakdown.

*Table 2: Failure to Supervise Cases, Allegations, and Results*

Year	Total Cases	Total Number of Allegations	Number of Allegations Resulting in Discipline
2011	18	36	8
2012	26	55	12
2013	4	4	0
2014	8	13	10
2015	4	9	1
2016	6	10	0
2017	4	5	2

The above table represents the total number of cases and allegations regarding complaints for MOR 285.00 (Failure to Supervise) that were taken against a Supervisor, Manager, or a Commander. When OPD conducts an investigation regarding an allegation of misconduct of an employee and the finding is sustained, OPD looks at the accountability of the supervisor, manager, or commander to ascertain if they are in compliance.

*Supervisor Discipline for All Allegations*

At the October 10, 2017 Public Safety Committee meeting, staff was asked to provide the number of allegations that resulted in discipline against supervisors, not just those that were based on failure to supervise. Table 3 provides a breakdown.

*Table 3: All Cases, Allegations, and Results with Supervisors as Subjects*

Year	Total Cases	Total Allegations	Number of Sustained Allegations Resulting in Discipline
2011	69	124	10
2012	189	325	37
2013	38	61	8
2014	52	79	17
2015	70	111	16
2016	68	103	6
2017	123	172	7

*Race of Supervisors Subject to Discipline*

At the January 9, 2018 Public Safety Committee meeting, staff was asked to provide the race of supervisors subject to discipline. Staff needs additional time to complete this request. We expect this request to be completed by August 2018. OPD will still need to work with the OCA to determine what information can be released for calendar year 2017.

**FISCAL IMPACT**

There is no immediate fiscal impact associated with this informational report.

**PUBLIC OUTREACH / INTEREST**

As a participant in the White House Police Data Initiative (PDI), OPD provides many metrics online on a regular basis, including information on discipline. The PDI provides information to the public on the OPD website in a number of areas of interest including police discipline, crowd management, stop data, and use of force.

**COORDINATION**

The Office of the City Attorney has reviewed this report for form and legality.

**SUSTAINABLE OPPORTUNITIES**

***Economic:*** There are no economic opportunities associated with this report.

***Environmental:*** There are no environmental opportunities associated with this report.

***Social Equity:*** All members of the Oakland community benefit from a police department that is more transparent, more accountable, better trained, and governed by effective policy.

**ACTION REQUESTED OF THE CITY COUNCIL**

**Staff Recommends That The City Council Accept This Informational Report Providing Information Regarding IAD Investigations, Police Personnel Trainings, Updates To Police Policy, And Recent Developments In Police Discipline.**

For questions regarding this report, please contact Timothy Birch, Police Services Manager, Office of the Chief of Police, Research and Planning at (510) 238-6443.

Respectfully submitted,



Anne E. Kirkpatrick  
Chief of Police  
Oakland Police Department

Prepared by:  
Timothy Birch, Police Services Manager  
OPD, Training Division, Research and Planning

Attachments (1):  
A – Fourth Quarter 2017 Internal Affairs Division Report

# Internal Affairs Division Year to Date 2017

(Reporting Period : 1/1/2017 to 12/31/2017)

<b>Cases</b>	<b>1264</b>	
<b>Allegations</b>	<b>3138</b>	
Cases Investigated		
<b>Division Level</b>	324 (Division Level Investigations are completed by a supervisor)	
<b>Intenal Affairs(IA)</b>	246 (Internal Affairs Investigations are completed by an IA investigator)	
<b>Total # of Investigations</b>	570	
Allegations Reviewed and Administratively Closed:878		
These complaints include but are not limited to: Outside Agency Complaints, Complaints of No Merit and Service Complaints*		
*Example of a Service Complaint: Community member alleges the officer took too long to respond to a complaint of dogs barking; however, the officer was sent to an in progress Domestic Violence call.		
Discipline		
Suspension(s)	23	
Counseling and/or Training	65	
Written Reprimand(s)	32	
Termination	7	
<b>Total Sustained Findings</b>	127	
Manual of Rules Violations (MOR)		
MOR	Description	# of Allegations
<b>000.01</b>	Service Complaint (A police practice mandated by policy or law, such as towing a vehicle; or a delay in service, such as a long wait for an officer's presence due to call for service volume)	513
<b>000.02</b>	No Violation of OPD Manual of Rules and/or the Law.	363
<b>000.03</b>	Duplicate Entry	21
<b>234.00</b>	AUTHORITY AND RESPONSIBILITIES Subject to direction from higher command, a commanding officer has direct control over all members and employees within his/her command.	7
<b>285.00</b>	AUTHORITY AND RESPONSIBILITIES – In addition to the general and individual responsibilities of all members and employees, each supervisor is specifically responsible for the following: Supervision, Leadership, Direction, Enforcement of Rules, Inspection, Assisting Subordinates, and Grievance Resolution. (Gross dereliction of duty)	3

285.90	Prevention of harassment, discrimination and retaliation.	1
314.03	GENERAL CONDUCT – Members and employees shall conduct themselves at all times in such a manner as to reflect favorably upon themselves, the City, the Department and the police service. Whether on or off-duty, members and employees shall avoid any conduct that brings disrepute to the Department or impairs its efficient and effective operation.	12
314.04	CONDUCT TOWARD OTHERS – HARASSMENT AND DISCRIMINATION –Members and employees shall treat all persons with courtesy and respect. The Department has a zero tolerance policy for harassment and discrimination against members, employees and persons on the basis of race, religion, national origin, marital status, age, sex, sexual orientation, ancestry, physical or mental disability, or medical condition. The Department prohibits conduct that violates the specified City Administrative Instruction. Any member or employee who harasses or discriminates against another member, employee, or any person, or engages in any inappropriate workplace conduct that violates City Administrative Instruction 71 shall be subject to severe disciplinary action, including discharge from the City service. Any member or employee who has knowledge that another member or employee has engaged in harassment or discrimination or inappropriate conduct that violates the specific City Administrative Instruction is strictly charged with the responsibility for reporting that conduct in accordance with the provisions of Manual of Rules Section 314.48 (Reporting Violations of Laws, Ordinances, Rules or Orders). Any member or employee who harasses or discriminates against another member, employee, or any person, or engages in any inappropriate workplace conduct that violates City Administrative Instruction 71 shall be subject to severe disciplinary action, including discharge from the City service. Any member or employee who has knowledge that another member or employee has engaged in harassment or discrimination or inappropriate conduct that violates the specific City Administrative Instruction is strictly charged with the responsibility for reporting that conduct in accordance with the provisions of Manual of Rules Section 314.48 (Reporting Violations of Laws, Ordinances, Rules or Orders).	142

<b>314.07</b>	CONDUCT TOWARD OTHERS – Demeanor – Members and employees shall perform their duties attentively and courteously, avoiding rude, threatening, harsh, insulting, profane, insolent or demeaning language, and they shall maintain a professional bearing regardless of provocation to do otherwise. Members and employees shall treat superior officers, subordinates, and peers with respect. They shall be courteous and civil at all times in their relationships with one another and shall avoid any inappropriate conduct. All persons, except the very youthful and those known personally by the member or employee, shall at all times be addressed by their appropriate title followed by their last name. When on duty and in the presence of others, superior officers shall be referred to by rank title. Members and employees shall attend to requests from the public quickly and accurately, avoiding unnecessary referral to other parts of the Department. Orders from superior to subordinate members and employees shall be given in a civil manner, without the use of profane or derogatory language.	224
<b>314.08</b>	CONDUCT TOWARD OTHERS – Relationships – Members and employees shall not inappropriately convert or attempt to convert an on-duty contact to an intimate relationship.	0
<b>314.28</b>	NOTIFICATION - Any member or employee who is a party to any of the following incidents shall prepare and forward via email or a hand-delivered memorandum directly to an IAD Commander within 72 hours:- Lawsuit (the member or employee is not required to report under this section when the City is also named as a party in the lawsuit); Arrested; CDL suspension or revocation or notification of CDL suspension or revocation; Cited, in lieu of arrest (except Vehicle Code infractions); Served with a civil or administrative process related to their employment or which contains allegations which rise to the level of a Manual of Rules violation; or becomes aware that he/she is under investigation for any misdemeanor or felony in this or another jurisdiction.	2
<b>314.30</b>	INSUBORDINATION-DISOBEDIENCE TO ORDERS – Failure of any member or employee to obey a lawful order given by a superior officer constitutes insubordination.	1
<b>314.32</b>	INSUBORDINATION-DISRESPECT – The act of ridiculing or treating with disrespect a superior officer or his/her orders whether in or out of his/her presence.	3
<b>314.38</b>	OBSTRUCTING THE INTERNAL AFFAIRS PROCESS – No member and employee shall obstruct, impede, delay, or undermine the internal investigation process in either words or actions.	2

314.39	PERFORMANCE OF DUTY – All members and employees shall perform their assigned duties and responsibilities as required or directed by law, Departmental rule, policy, or order by a competent authority. Each member and employee is accountable for the exercise of delegated authority, and shall not conceal, divert or mitigate their true culpability. Violations of performance of duty include, but are not limited to, the following: Intentional illegal search, seizure, or arrest; unintentional or improper search, seizure, or arrest; planting of evidence; failure to perform duties as required or directed by law, Departmental rule, policy, or order; improper care of the property of persons; and changing a work assignment without authority.	1232
314.42	OBEDIENCE TO LAWS – Members and employees shall observe and obey all laws and ordinances. A violation of this section may include, but is not limited to the following: Felony and serious misdemeanor crimes; other misdemeanor crimes; or driver's license status.	32
314.48	REPORTING VIOLATIONS OF LAWS, ORDINANCES, RULES OR ORDERS – Members and employees who become aware that other members or employees violated laws, ordinances, rules of the Department, or disobeyed orders, of a Class I violation or any Class II violation which indicates a pattern of misconduct of which they are aware, shall within 24 hours or sooner, if practical, report the offense, orally or in writing, to his/her supervisor or the Internal Affairs Division.	6
314.69	GIFTS, GRATUITIES – SOLICITING OR ACCEPTING – Members and employees shall not use their authority or position, whether for him/herself or another, and not otherwise available to them as a private person: Members and employees shall not use their authority to solicit or accept contributions for the Department or for any other agency, organization, event, or cause without the express consent of the Chief of Police or designee.	1
314.70	USES OF PRIVILEGED INFORMATION – Members and employees are prohibited from using information, not available to the public, gained through their position as a law enforcement officer or within the Department to gain a financial or other benefit for themselves or another.	0
328.07	PROHIBITED ACTIVITY ON DUTY – Members and employees are prohibited from engaging in the following activities while on duty: Sexual activity; Sleeping, loafing, idling; Conducting private business; Carrying of articles not associated with the performance of police duties; or gambling, unless to further a police purpose.	13
328.14	LOITERING – On-duty members and employees, and off-duty members and employees in uniform shall not enter bars, taverns or theaters except to perform a police task. Loitering and unnecessary conversation in such locations is forbidden. Eating in establishments where the primary purpose is the service of alcoholic beverages rather than food is discouraged, although not forbidden.	0

<b>328.49</b>	ABSENCE FROM DUTY – Every member or employee who fails to appear for duty at the date, time and place specified without the consent of competent authority is absent without leave Absences without leave in excess of one day shall be reported in writing to the Chief of Police.	1
<b>328.63</b>	CONSUMPTION OF INTOXICANTS – Members and employees shall not at any time.	4
<b>342.00</b>	DEPARTMENT PROPERTY AND EQUIPMENT – Preventable Collision	66
<b>342.19</b>	<p>DAMAGED, INOPERATIVE PROPERTY OR EQUIPMENT – Members and employees shall immediately report to their immediate supervisor or commanding officer any loss of or damage to Departmental property or equipment assigned to or used by them. The immediate superior shall be notified of any defects or hazardous conditions existing in any Departmental equipment or property.</p> <p>In the event that Department property is found bearing evidence of damage that has not been reported, it shall constitute presumptive evidence that the last person using the property or vehicle was responsible.</p>	1
<b>356.30</b>	ACCESSING, VIEWING, DOWNLOADING, PROVIDING, SHARING INAPPROPRIATE MATERIAL Members and employees shall not intentionally access, view, download, provide, or share inappropriate material while on-duty or in a police facility, except in the performance of an official police task.	0
<b>356.89</b>	IMPROPER DISSEMINATION OF COMPUTER INFORMATION – Members and employees shall not disseminate information obtained from a Departmental/City computer without proper authorization.	5
<b>356.90</b>	UNAUTHORIZED USE OF ELECTRONIC SYSTEMS – Members and employees shall not use or access Departmental/City/County computer systems/databases/records and/or other communication equipment unless authorized to do so by competent authority.	1
<b>370.27</b>	PHYSICAL FORCE, USE OF – The use of physical force (Level 1-4) shall be restricted to circumstances specified y Departmental policies and law.	317
<b>370.36</b>	CUSTODY OF PRISONERS – Arrestees and/or detainees shall be reasonably controlled in order to prevent their escape. They shall be treated humanely and shall not be subjected to unnecessary restraint. The arresting officer(s) shall notify the transportation officers of any special care the prisoner may need. Responsibility for both the prisoner and his/her personal property transfers from the arresting officer to the transportation officer when they accept custody of the prisoner	8

<b>370.45</b>	REPORTS AND BOOKINGS – No member or employee shall knowingly: Submit false/inaccurate/improper Departmental records with the intent to assist prosecution or defense. Falsify time records or financial records for fraudulent purposes. Falsify official reports or records. Falsify or alter evidence.	3
<b>370.63</b>	SECURITY OF DEPARTMENTAL BUSINESS – Members and employees shall not reveal confidential reports, records, and/or information to an unauthorized person. Questions regarding the disclosure of information shall be referred to competent authority.	2
<b>370.72</b>	COMPROMISING CRIMINAL CASES – Members and employees shall not:  - Interrupt, attempt to interrupt, or improperly influence the legal process; - Engage in any activity with the intent to interfere with a criminal investigation, charging, or prosecution of any case; or - Fail/refuse to cooperate with an official criminal investigation upon direction of a competent department authority	0
<b>370.81</b>	INTERFERING WITH INVESTIGATIONS – Members and employees are prohibited from contacting any witnesses, complainants, or subjects involved with internal or Citizens’ Police Review Board (CPRB) investigations for the purpose of discussing or influencing their testimony or persuading them to withdraw complaints. When routine contact with such persons is unavoidable, members and employees shall refrain from any discussion of complaints against Department personnel or testimony relating to those complaints	0
<b>398.70</b>	INTERFERING WITH INVESTIGATIONS – Members and employees are prohibited from contacting any witnesses, complainants, or subjects involved with internal or Citizens’ Police Review Board (CPRB) investigations for the purpose of discussing or influencing their testimony or persuading them to withdraw complaints. When routine contact with such persons is unavoidable, members and employees shall refrain from any discussion of complaints against Department personnel or testimony relating to those complaints.	2
<b>398.73</b>	RETALIATION – Under no circumstances shall members or employees retaliate against any other member, employee, or any other person for engaging in a protected activity. Members and employees shall not engage in any adverse action that: Would cause a reasonable member, employee, or any other person to be deterred from engaging in a protected activity; or is based on a retaliatory motive arising out of a member, employee, or any other person engaging in a protected activity. Any member or employee who becomes aware of such conduct shall immediately report the misconduct to a commander/manager, and/or directly to the Internal Affairs Division. The presumptive penalty for violation of this section shall be termination.	9

<b>398.76</b>	REFUSAL TO ACCEPT OR REFER COMPLAINT – Members and employees shall not refuse to accept a citizen complaint, fail to refer a citizen to the IAD (when the citizen can be reasonably understood to want to make a citizen’s complaint), fail to forward a complaint to the IAD, discourage a person from filing a complaint, and/or knowingly provide false, inaccurate, or incomplete information about the IAD process. Members and employees shall not fail to follow any of the procedures for accepting, referring, or forwarding a complaint.	88
<b>398.77</b>	REFUSAL TO SUPPLY NAME AND SERIAL NUMBER – Upon request, members and employees shall supply their names and serial numbers to any person who seeks such identification.	29
<b>398.80</b>	TRUTHFULNESS – Members and employees are required to be truthful at all times whether under oath or not, except when necessary in the performance of official duties.	14
<b>Misc.</b>	Internally generated complaint. See IAD Commander for details.	0

**IAD Allegations**

- Conduct (Class I) Harassment & Discrimination, Workplace Violence, Insubordination, Intoxicants, Improper Dissemination of Information, Custody of Prisoners, Assisting Criminals
- Conduct (Class II)
- Dept Property and Equipment
- Obedience to Laws and Regulations (Class I)
- Obedience to Laws and Regulations (Class II)
- Performance of Duty (Class I)
- Performance of Duty(Class II)
- Retaliation, Interfering, Refusal to Take Complaint or Provide Name, Failure to Report Misconduct
- Service, No MOR, Duplicate
- Supervision and Command
- Truthfulness and False Reports
- Use of Force



