



FILED
OFFICE OF THE CITY CLERK
OAKLAND

2020 FEB 13 PM 4:51

AGENDA REPORT

TO: Sabrina B. Landreth
City Administrator

FROM: Darin White
Fire Chief

SUBJECT: Quarterly Report on Public Safety
Overtime (OFD)

DATE: February 7, 2020

City Administrator Approval

Date:

2/13/20

RECOMMENDATION

Staff Recommends That The City Council Receive An Informational Report From The Oakland Fire Department On The Use Of Overtime During the Second Quarter Of Fiscal Year 2019-20, That Includes Additional Information on Overtime Policy, Use, and Accountability.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This informational report provides data on the Oakland Fire Department (OFD) overtime policy, use, and accountability in Fiscal Year (FY) 2019-20.

For FY 2019-20, overspending above the City Council Adopted Budget continued, primarily attributed to overtime costs in Public Safety. Total all funds, the OFD overtime spending fiscal year to date through December 31, 2019 was \$13,135,167.

Per Ordinance No. 13487 C.M.S, in the event that a Department is projected to overspend in the General Purpose Fund (GPF) by more than one percent (1%), the Department must provide an action plan to the City Administrator. The City Administrator shall bring an Informational Report to the City Council within sixty (60) days following acceptance of the Revenue and Expenditure report by the City Council. The report shall list the actions the Administration is taking to bring the expenditures into alignment with the budget.

This report also provides details on how the Department aims to control overtime expenditures with real actionable changes to policies, procedures, and processes, and corresponding accountability mechanisms.

BACKGROUND / LEGISLATIVE HISTORY

On October 24, 2017, staff presented a report titled, "Fiscal Year (FY) 2016-17 Fourth Quarter Revenue and Expenditure Results and Year-End Summaries for the GPF (GPF, 1010) and Eight (8) Selected Funds; and GPF, 1010 Carryforward for FY 2017-18; and Overtime Analysis for the GPF, 1010 and All Funds" to the Finance and Management Committee.

Following the initial report, OFD has presented regular reports on departmental overtime. The most recent report was presented on October 22, 2019

ANALYSIS AND POLICY ALTERNATIVES

Oakland Fire Department Authorized Staffing

OFD operates twenty-five (25) fire stations located throughout the city, twenty-four (24) hours per day, seven (7) days per week. OFD is responsible for fire and medical dispatch, fire prevention, fire suppression, mitigation, emergency medical response, specialized rescue operations, fire investigation, emergency management, and fire code inspection within the city.

Currently, OFD has five hundred and nine (509.00) Full Time Equivalent (FTE) sworn personnel and one hundred forty-two and twenty-three hundredths (142.23) FTE civilian personnel authorized, for a total of six hundred fifty-one and twenty-three hundredths (651.23) FTE.

OFD sworn personnel operate using a "chain of command" or "rank" system. Table 1 shows the Department's sworn rank organizational structure by job classification:

Table 1. Sworn Ranks

<u>Rank</u>
Fire Chief
Deputy Chief of Fire Department
Assistant Chief of Fire Department
Fire Marshal (Sworn)
Battalion Chief
Assistant Fire Marshal (Sworn)
Captain of Fire Department
Lieutenant of Fire Department
Fire Investigator
Engineer of Fire Department
Firefighter-Paramedic
Firefighter

There are seventeen (17.00) FTE 40-Hour staff positions; and there are four hundred and ninety-two (492.00) FTE 48-Hour shift positions totaling five hundred and nine (509.00) FTE sworn personnel. Operationally, OFD fire suppression shift staff are organized into three (3) shifts referred to as A, B and C Shift. Shift positions operate on a 48/96 schedule whereby members work two (2) shifts (48-Hours) followed by four (4) days off.

Fire Suppression Minimum Staffing

The Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between the City of Oakland (City) and International Association of Fire Fighters, Local 55 (Local 55), guides working conditions of the represented OFD sworn personnel. Additionally, OFD provides Aircraft Rescue Firefighting (ARFF) Services at the Oakland International Airport under the terms of an MOU between the City and the Port of Oakland (Port).

Section 4.2.4 of the MOU between the City and Local 55 identified through the year 2027, daily minimum staffing levels for "Fire Suppression Staffing" of OFD sworn personnel. The MOU minimum staffing sets a daily number of sworn staff, broken out by specific ranks, which must be in the field at any given time. The total suppression staffing equates to one hundred and thirty-seven (137.00) FTE sworn personnel per shift and four hundred and eleven (411.00) FTE sworn personnel to cover all three (3) shifts. This staffing level includes the ARFF staffing requirements of a minimum of six (6.00) FTE sworn personnel (one (1.00) FTE Officer and five (5.00) FTE Firefighters).

Table 2 shows the minimum fire suppression staffing by rank required based upon these two (2) MOUs.

Table 2. Fire Suppression Minimum Staffing By Shift & FTE

Rank	Number of FTE			
	A Shift	B Shift	C Shift	Total A, B & C Shift Staffing
Battalion Chief	3.00	3.00	3.00	9.00
Captain of Fire Department	14.00	13.00	14.00	41.00
Lieutenant of Fire Department	18.00	19.00	18.00	55.00
Engineer of Fire Department	24.00	24.00	24.00	72.00
Fire Investigator	1.00	1.00	1.00	3.00
Firefighter-Paramedic	26.00	26.00	26.00	78.00
Firefighter	51.00	51.00	51.00	153.00
Total Minimum Staffing	137.00	137.00	137.00	411.00

Sworn personnel are assigned daily as follows:

- Three (3) Battalions staffed with one (1) Battalion Chief each
- Twenty-four (24) Engine Companies each staffed with a minimum of one (1) Officer, (1) one Engineer, one (1) Firefighter-Paramedic and one (1) Firefighter

- One (1) Aircraft Rescue Firefighter (ARFF) company staffed with a minimum of one (1) Captain and five (5) Firefighters
- Seven (7) Truck Companies staffed as follows:
 - Three (3) Truck companies with a minimum of one (1) Captain and (3) three Firefighters;
 - One (1) Truck company with a minimum of one (1) Captain, one (1) Firefighter-Paramedic and two Firefighters;
 - Two (2) Truck companies with a minimum of one (1) Captain and four (4) Firefighters;
 - One (1) Truck company staffed with a minimum of one (1) Captain, one (1) Firefighter-Paramedic and three (3) Firefighters; and
 - One (1) Fire Investigator.

The positions shown in Table 2 are the minimum number of sworn positions per shift. However, achieving this daily staffing level is hampered by the following:

- Vacancies;
- "40-Hour" Staff Assignments;
- Training;
- Vacation;
- Injuries;
- Deployments; and
- Other time off.

Oakland Fire Department Fiscal Year 2019-20 Budgeted Overtime Funding

In FY 2019-20, the Department had two (2) main funding sources for overtime, GPF (1010) and Measure Z (2252). As identified in Table 3 the FY 2019-20 GPF (1010) budgeted overtime funding is shown below:

Table 3 Dedicated GPF (1010) Funding for Overtime Expenditures

FUND	ORG	FY 19-20 BUDGET
1010 - General Fund: General Purpose		
	20241 - Fire Communications	\$15,140
	20251 - Communications Emergency Dispatch	\$63,410
	20311 - Fire Marshal's Office	\$1,790
	20331 - Inspectional Services	\$48,878
	20341 - Arson Investigation	\$9,339
	20371 - Vegetation Management	\$137,776
	20411 - Emergency / Suppression: Shift A	\$1,370,166
	20631 - In-Service Training	\$18,314
	20814 - Fire: Airport	\$62,973
	20816 - Fire: Support Services	\$3,418
	TOTAL	\$1,731,204

The other significant budgeted funding source for overtime in FY 2019-20 is two million dollars (\$2,000,000) from Measure Z* (2252).

First and Second Quarter FY 2019-20 OFD Overtime Hours

Table 4 shows the Department's total overtime hours and costs during the first and second quarters of FY 2019-20.

Table 4: First & Second Quarter FY 2019-20 OFD Overtime Hours

Overtime Cost - 1st Quarter FY 2019-20 (07/01/19 - 09/30/19)		
<u>Sworn Rank</u>	<u>OT Hours</u>	<u>Overtime Cost</u>
Battalion Chief	2,911	\$290,925
Fire Marshall, Assistant	50	\$5,617
Captain of Fire Department	10,093	\$873,880
Lieutenant of Fire Department	13,742	\$1,104,617
Fire Investigator	240	\$19,262
Engineer of Fire Department	16,001	\$1,207,049
Fire Fighter Paramedic	14,830	\$1,129,553
Fire Fighter	26,341	\$1,818,651
Total 1st QTR Sworn OT	84,208	\$6,449,554
Total 1st QTR Civilian OT	3,929	\$267,035
TOTAL 1st QTR OFD OT	88,136	\$6,716,589
Overtime Cost - 2nd Quarter FY 2019-20 (10/01/19 - 12/31/19)		
<u>Sworn Rank</u>	<u>OT Hours</u>	<u>Overtime Cost</u>
Battalion Chief	3,066	\$319,386
Fire Marshall, Assistant	32	\$3,677
Captain of Fire Department	8,585	\$769,864
Lieutenant of Fire Department	13,337	\$1,104,129
Fire Investigator	360	\$29,784
Engineer of Fire Department	15,578	\$1,204,726
Fire Fighter Paramedic	14,312	\$1,112,212
Fire Fighter	22,849	\$1,613,937
Total 2nd QTR Sworn OT	78,119	\$6,157,715
Total 2nd QTR Civilian OT	3,823	\$260,863
TOTAL 2nd QTR OFD OT	81,942	\$6,418,578
TOTAL 1st & 2nd Quarter FY 2019-20 OFD Overtime	170,079	\$13,135,167

Oakland Fire Department FY 2018-19 Overtime Spending

Total all funds OFD overtime spending fiscal year to date through December 31, 2019 was \$13,135,167.

Ongoing Efforts To Identify and Reduce Overtime Usage

Unless the overtime in fire suppression pertains to a backfill of staffing due to leave, illness, or injury, all overtime requests must be approved by the Chief of the Fire Department.

While much of the overtime usage for OFD is in Operations, not all overtime in Operations overtime is specific to backfill. Overtime can also be triggered by Red Flag working days due to unpredictable weather events, lasting between 12-72 hours, and other special events where OFD is called to participate or prepare.

In November 2019, OFD graduated 17 new recruits. They are all currently working at their assigned stations on a probationary basis, offsetting the need for overtime and mandatory backfill. OFD did not have an academy in FY 2018-19.

Beginning October 2018, OFD began working with the Finance and Information Technology Departments to add a more detailed level of time codes to provide for overtime tracking that can readily identify overtime by type such as Field Operations Minimum Staffing, Red Flag Days, Academy Cadre, Callback, Mutual Aid, Other Deployment Backfill, Training, Special Projects, etc. It is anticipated this will aid in identifying operational needs to better control and reduce overtime.

The Fire Dispatch Center has recently experienced a higher rate of overtime usage due to vacancies however over the last several months, the division has made progress to mitigate these costs.

OFD increased its budgeted positions to eighteen (18) Fire Communications Dispatchers in July, 2019. OFD had an increase in one (1) FTE in the Fire Communications Supervisor rank, as well, bringing the budgeted staffing to five (5). All of the supervisor positions are filled, although two (2) are on long term leave. The goal of the Communications Center is to continue to meet the operational demands of the department and eventually staff each shift (Day, Swing and Grave) with four (4) dispatchers and one (1) supervisor and to staff without utilizing either voluntary or mandatory overtime based on recent personnel increases.

The Fire Dispatch Center (FDC) relies on the guidance and recommendations of the National Emergency Number Association (NENA) which works with 9-1-1 professionals nationwide, public policy leaders, and emergency services and telecommunications industry partners to develop and carry out critical programs, staffing criteria, and initiatives in line with industry leading standards, training, and certifications.

Based on the Fire Dispatch Center's call volume in 2018 and by using the Erlang-C formula, a traffic modeling formula used in call center scheduling to calculate delays or predict waiting times for callers, NENA recommended OFD increase the number of dispatch personnel per shift to five (5). Increasing the FDC by two (2) full time employees to a total of twenty (20), as proposed in the FY 2019-20 budget, will do the following:

- Eliminate the need for excessive overtime
- Cover all City leaves (Sick "SCK," Family and Medical Leave Act "FMLA," Vacation
- "VAC," and Compensatory Time Unsworn "CTU") with four (4) minimum staffing

- Reduce answering speeds
- Lessens call abandoned call rate
- Address increased call volume

Several other events or circumstances also may trigger the use of overtime, including:

- Emergency Recall Incidents (this would cover any call back of sworn staff such as a Safety Officer or Assistant Sworn Fire Marshal having to work after hours – or up staffing an engine during an unanticipated emergency event).
- Incidents that happen at shift change will usually require OT to allow for exchange of personnel at the incident.
- Backfill for members assigned to special projects (Computer Aided Dispatch, Accela, Drill Tower, etc.).
- Backfilling apparatus committee to allow for them to do their side job of fleet management (i.e. travel back to factory during apparatus design and build).
- Backfilling for other approved travel such as trainings, conferences, and meetings out of the area
- Instances where compliance is at risk or for disciplinary reasons; OFD recently had a member out of compliance with their Emergency Medical Technician license and the individual had to be placed on 40hr assignment that required backfill.

The proud men and women of the Oakland Fire Department are committed to providing the highest quality of courteous and responsive services to the residents of Oakland. Staff continuously evaluate these strategies and personnel to ensure that OFD promotes and represents current best practices in order to increase the efficiency and effectiveness of the department. All Bureau Chiefs and Division Managers are encouraged to utilize all available tools and metrics to evaluate the goals, objectives, costs, and outcomes for their respective division.

FISCAL IMPACT

This item is for informational purposes only and does not have a direct fiscal impact or cost.

PUBLIC OUTREACH / INTEREST

This item does not require additional public outreach, other than posting on the City's website.

COORDINATION

This is an informational report from the Oakland Fire Department.

SUSTAINABLE OPPORTUNITIES

Economic: There are severe economic impacts that follow medium to large scale fire events. Having a fully staffed department is critical to preventing that type of economic hardship from becoming a reality for our community and region.

Environmental: Having a fully staffed fire department plays a key role in how we respond to potentially catastrophic event that might have devastating impacts on our environment, from a topographical and air quality standpoint.

Race & Equity: A fully staffed fire department is beneficial to all residents, businesses and visitors of Oakland.

ACTION REQUESTED OF THE CITY COUNCIL

Staff Recommends That The City Council Receive an Informational Report from the Oakland Fire Department on the Use of Overtime During the Second Quarter of Fiscal Year 2019-20, That Includes Additional Information on Overtime Policy, Use, and Accountability.

For questions regarding this report, please contact Michael Hunt, Chief of Staff at 510-238-6353.

Respectfully submitted,



DARIN WHITE
Chief, Oakland Fire Department

Prepared by:
Gene Tom, Chief Financial Officer &
Administrative Services Manager
Oakland Fire Department