



CITY OF OAKLAND  
CITY COUNCIL

FILED  
OFFICE OF THE CITY CLERK  
OAKLAND

2009 MAR -5 7PM 2:40

## LEGISLATIVE ANALYST MEMORANDUM

**To:** Finance & Management Committee  
**From:** Sabrina Landreth, Legislative Analyst  
**Date:** March 10, 2009  
**Re:** 2009 Lighting, Parks and Trees Emergency Health and Safety Measure

This Supplemental Report responds to the following questions raised about the proposed Parcel Tax at the February 24, 2009 Finance Committee.

### **1. What are the results of the October Revise on the LLAD-related service levels this year?**

“Attachment A” shows the service levels for parks, medians, mowing, tree maintenance, electrical and custodial prior to the October 2008 reductions and after the adopted October revised budget.

In the Mayor’s October 16, 2008 letter to the City Council a three-pronged approach to manage major reductions in LLAD funding was provided. The following is an excerpt.

- 1. A number of locations (30-40 acres) will no longer receive routine service. Instead, maintenance will be provided on an as-needed basis. Signage will be placed informing the public that the location will no longer receive routine services and asking for community, commitment to adopt the given location. (In progress spring 2009)*
- 2. All landscape assets will have decreased service levels. The current service levels divide the City into 32 Hubs, each are a defined geographic area that are the responsibility of the landscape staff. The number of Hubs will be decreased due to the decrease in staff, therefore giving each crew an increased number of locations to maintain. (Implemented)*
- 3. A transfer of responsibility is proposed for a number of locations (80 acres). This includes property owned by other public agencies that the City is currently maintaining. In some cases, leases have expired and staff is proposing to formally notify the agency that the City will no longer maintain the location. In other cases, there are agreements with the Office of Parks and Recreation that will lead to the reallocation of responsibilities. (Pending)*

**2. What will the additional service reductions be next year (and reduced FTEs) should this additional revenue not be realized by July 1, 2009? (Effect on all the funds that support LLAD related activities, not just the LLAD itself.)**

Staff estimates that about \$2.5 - \$3.0 million in additional reductions will be necessary to achieve balanced funds for LLAD related activities. This could result in 25-30 FTE reductions.

**3. Will the \$8.0 million be sufficient to cover the anticipated shortfall for next year and allow the City to bring the service levels back to pre-October levels?**

The October 2008 revised budget cut \$5.5 million dollars from LLAD related activities. With the additional reductions projected at \$2.5 - \$3.0 million in FY 2009-11 the total would be \$8.0 – 8.5 million.

**4. What are the number of staff by function - park maintenance, median maintenance, tree division, electrical division, or whatever the functions are – and (1) give the number from 07-08, and then (2) the number after the October revise? Also, show how many positions were moved to other funds.**

Attachment B is a summary of the requested information.

**Attachment A**  
**Landscaping and Lighting Assessment District Related**  
**Maintenance Service Levels**

Before October 2008 Reductions	After October 2008 Reductions
<b>PARKS</b>	
<p>Current staffing levels divide the City into 32 Hubs (geographical areas) and includes assistance from KOCB for litter abatement on landscaped medians.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Rose Garden – 2 FTE’s</li> <li>▪ Lakeside Park – 6 FTE’s</li> <li>▪ Joaquin Miller and Open Space – 3 FTE’s</li> </ul>	<p>All landscaped assets will have decreased service levels. There will be 19 Hubs and 6 Median Crews meaning larger geographical areas are being covered with less staff.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Rose Garden – 1 FTE</li> <li>▪ Lakeside Park – 4 FTE’s</li> <li>▪ Joaquin Miller and Open Space – 2 FTE’s</li> </ul>
Each gardener FTE covers approximately 7.6 developed park acres.	Each gardener FTE will have 9.2 developed park acres. This ratio will increase with new parks and streetscapes being built.
All parks, open spaces, medians and streetscapes are maintained on a routine schedule.	A number of locations (30-40 acres) will no longer receive routine services. Instead, maintenance will be provided on as as-needed basis. Signage will be placed informing the public that the location will no longer receive routine services and asking for community commitment to adopt the given location.
Each Hub consists of two full-time employees and some have seasonal part-time staff.	Some Hubs will have a Gardener Crew Leader and a part-time Park Attendant. All hubs will cover a larger number of locations and acreage.
Most parks receive twice a week litter removal service (litter receptacle service and scattered litter).	Litter removal at some locations will be reduced to once a week or once every 2 weeks. Reduced litter service could generate public complaints about unclean park conditions.
All parks have litter receptacles.	Some parks will not have litter receptacles. Some may have curbside litter receptacles, only. All containers at City parking lots will be removed
Weed removal is a routine activity in spring and has been very challenging with the “before reduction” staffing levels.	Weed removal in spring will be a much greater problem because there will not be sufficient staff to cut down weeds in a timely manner. This could generate complaints about overgrown weed conditions in parks and the weeds could potentially become a fire hazard especially on open space properties.
New parks, medians and streetscapes are absorbed by maintenance staff without additional funding.	All new capital projects including Measure DD, Redevelopment Agency and grant funded, etc. will require additional staffing and operation and maintenance funding. New capital projects with a landscaping component will decline

**Attachment A**  
**Landscaping and Lighting Assessment District Related**  
**Maintenance Service Levels**

<b>Before October 2008 Reductions</b>	<b>After October 2008 Reductions</b>
	quickly due to a lack of landscape maintenance.
Public Works maintains a variety of properties (80 acres +) owned by other public agencies through lease agreements, non-project agreements and other arrangements.	A transfer of responsibility is proposed for a number of locations (80 acres). This includes property owned by other public agencies that the City is currently maintaining. There are agreements with the Office of Parks and Recreation that will lead to the reallocation of responsibilities.
Medians and Streetscapes – Median and streetscape maintenance (litter pickup, weed control, irrigation repair, etc.) is performed in each Hub.	Six Median Crews will be assigned to 100+ medians and streetscapes. Weeds on medians will be a low priority and will be handled only as a public safety matter.
Utility Worker PPT - 8 KOCB employees (5.5 FTE) provide litter removal on medians.	Utility Worker PPT positions eliminated and Median Hubs are created (see above). This will result in increased litter on medians.
Mowing - once every 10-14 days on average. This assumes full staffing and limited need for major repairs such as irrigation mainline breaks, support for other maintenance or Paygo projects.	Mowing - once every 12-18 days. During spring, the mowing schedule could be even longer due to wet soil conditions when larger mowing equipment cannot be used. Staff will have to operate smaller, less efficient mowers until the turf conditions dry out. The longer grass height could impede sports on athletic fields.
Park Equipment Operators operate trenchers, tractors, seeders, fertilizers, aerators, topdressings machines, graders and other pieces of equipment for turf maintenance and park maintenance, and volunteer activities that request support and Paygo projects.	Park Equipment Operators' revised mowing schedule will not allow time to assist on park maintenance work requests such as athletic field repairs, irrigation repairs involving trenching, or other requests without negatively impacting the mowing schedule. They will not be available to perform "volunteer" directed work or Pay-go projects unless it is approved on an overtime basis and after regular work hours.
Coordination of park volunteers is centralized.	Coordination of park volunteers will be decentralized to Park Supervisors and even Gardener Crew Leaders. Volunteer model for PWA will be revised.
Park volunteers supplement staff efforts.	Park volunteers are needed for basic maintenance.
Open Space properties receive routine litter removal and some trail maintenance and fuel reduction services.	Open Space properties will receive minimal services.
<b>STREETLIGHTING</b>	
Repair of the City's 36,000 streetlights	Repair of the City's streetlights will average 7

**Attachment A**  
**Landscaping and Lighting Assessment District Related**  
**Maintenance Service Levels**

<b>Before October 2008 Reductions</b>	<b>After October 2008 Reductions</b>
averages 72 hours to 7 days	to 15 days
Knocked down poles are replaced in within 7 days	Knocked down poles are replaced as scheduling permits.
<b>TREES</b>	
Annually 1000 + trees are planted Citywide	No more tree planting except Arbor Day with 13 trees planted this year to retain our Tree City USA designation
Annually 200 + trees are watered regularly by trucks for the first 2-3 years	No more truck watering in commercial areas, parks, around schools or in medians
Annually over 4,800 trees are pruned annually for health, safety and aesthetics	Fewer than 2000 trees will be pruned annually in order to minimize hazards
1264 London Plane trees are pollarded on a five-year rotational cycle. The London Plane trees can be found in 5 general areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Grand Avenue</li> <li>• Lakeshore Homes Association</li> <li>• Sobrante Park</li> <li>• Broadway &amp; Lakeside Park</li> <li>• Havenscourt Bl. &amp; East Oakland</li> </ul>	Some of the previously pollarded London Plane trees will only be pruned to provide clearance for vehicles, pedestrians and from structures. These trees will be allowed to grow to a mature size with a natural canopy shape. The London Plane trees growing under high voltage power lines will continue to be pollarded to maintain their smaller sized canopies.
Emergency response – Last year over 850 emergency calls were responded to (including after regular business hours).	Delays may occur due to reduced staff being available to respond to numerous calls during storm conditions.
Inspections – All service requests for any tree work require an inspection. The Inspector also is responsible for inspecting trees listed on tree permits, dead or hazardous trees on private property, illegal tree removals, PG&E tree removal requests, claims filed with the Office of the City Attorney, and assisting with view-related claims.	Delays will occur in completing inspections. Timelines required by OMC ordinances may not be met.
<b>CUSTODIAL</b>	
PWA staff performed custodial services at Enterprise Facilities: Lakeside Garden Center Sailboat House <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Joaquin Miller Community Center</li> <li>▪ Woodminster</li> <li>▪ Leona Lodge</li> <li>▪ Sequoia Lodge</li> </ul>	PWA no longer maintains these locations. Parks and Recreation has replaced the custodial staff that was eliminated with various similar classified positions and is maintaining the event set-ups and cleaning at these locations.

**Attachment A**  
**Landscaping and Lighting Assessment District Related**  
**Maintenance Service Levels**

<b>Before October 2008 Reductions</b>	<b>After October 2008 Reductions</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Columbian Gardens</li> </ul>	
<p>Staff performs weekend custodial set up and cleaning services at Redwood Heights, Science Center, Rotary Nature Center and Woodminster</p>	<p>Service at these locations will be done by the Park and Recreation staff funded by rental fees.</p>
<p>The custodial Unit 11.29 FTE positions 4.0 full-time and 7.29 Part-time are responsible for cleaning at Oakland Public Libraries</p>	<p>Reduction of 2.5 FTE Custodial Part-time staff will result in the elimination of the Project Crew which adversely affects services at all branch locations. This reduction will result in longer response times for completion of special cleaning requests. Carpet cleaning, floor maintenance such as stripping, waxing and buffing will now be performed on a semi-annual schedule instead of quarterly. Tasks such as dusting book shelves, cleaning blinds, cleaning windows, wiping walls will be performed less frequent and (as needed) instead of monthly.</p>

Attachment B  
Landscaping and Lighting Assessment District Related  
Staffing Levels

PROG	FUND	FY 2008-09 ADPT MID	FY 2008-09 OCT REVISE	FTE CHANGE	% CHANGE
PARKS, GROUNDS & MEDIANS	1010 - General Fund: General Purpose	7.90	2.00	(5.90)	
	1720 - Comprehensive Clean-up	18.40	25.50	7.10	
	2211 - Measure B: ACTIA	15.22	16.47	1.25	
	2310 - Lighting and Landscape Assessment District	56.48	33.48	(23.00)	
<b>PARKS, GROUNDS &amp; MEDIANS Total</b>		<b>98.00</b>	<b>77.45</b>	<b>(20.55)</b>	<b>-20.97%</b>
TREES	1010 - General Fund: General Purpose		5.00	5.00	
	2310 - Lighting and Landscape Assessment District	32.18	15.00	(17.18)	
<b>TREES Total</b>		<b>32.18</b>	<b>20.00</b>	<b>(12.18)</b>	<b>-37.85%</b>
ELECTRICAL & ENERGY EFFICIENCY	2310 - Lighting and Landscape Assessment District	4.50	2.50	(2.00)	
<b>ELECTRICAL &amp; ENERGY EFFICIENCY Total</b>		<b>4.50</b>	<b>2.50</b>	<b>(2.00)</b>	<b>-44.44%</b>
FACILITIES MANAGEMENT & MAINT	2310 - Lighting and Landscape Assessment District	31.40	22.90	(8.50)	
<b>FACILITIES MANAGEMENT &amp; MAINT Total</b>		<b>31.40</b>	<b>22.90</b>	<b>(8.50)</b>	<b>-27.07%</b>
BUDGET ANALYSIS & OPERATIONS	2310 - Lighting and Landscape Assessment District	0.50	0.50	-	
ADVISORY SERVICES	2310 - Lighting and Landscape Assessment District	0.80	0.80	-	
FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT	2310 - Lighting and Landscape Assessment District	1.30	0.20	(1.10)	
TECHNOLOGY MANAGEMENT	2310 - Lighting and Landscape Assessment District	0.25		(0.25)	
<b>GENERAL GOVERNMENT Total</b>		<b>2.85</b>	<b>1.50</b>	<b>(1.35)</b>	<b>-47.37%</b>
RECREATION, CULTURAL CIVIC	2310 - Lighting and Landscape Assessment District	1.00	1.00	-	
BALL FIELDS	2310 - Lighting and Landscape Assessment District	6.29	6.29	-	
<b>PARKS AND RECREATION Total</b>		<b>7.29</b>	<b>7.29</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.00%</b>
KEEP OAKLAND CLEAN & BEAUTIFUL	1010 - General Fund: General Purpose	3.00		(3.00)	
	1720 - Comprehensive Clean-up	2.50		(2.50)	
	2310 - Lighting and Landscape Assessment District	1.00	1.00	-	
<b>KEEP OAKLAND CLEAN &amp; BEAUTIFUL Total</b>		<b>6.50</b>	<b>1.00</b>	<b>(5.50)</b>	<b>-84.62%</b>
MUSEUM VISITOR SERVICES	2310 - Lighting and Landscape Assessment District	4.00	2.00	(2.00)	
<b>TOTAL CHANGE IN FTE - LLAD ELIGIBLE ACTIVITIES</b>		<b>186.72</b>	<b>134.64</b>	<b>(52.08)</b>	<b>-27.89%</b>

Total FTE Moved to Non-LLAD Funds from LLAD	13.35
Total FTE Eliminated from the LLAD Fund	52.08
<b>TOTAL REDUCTION IN LLAD FUNDED FTE</b>	<b>65.43</b>